



Cambridge International AS & A Level

HINDUISM

9487/04

Paper 4 Hinduism In Contemporary Society

October/November 2022

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 60

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2022 series for most Cambridge IGCSE™, Cambridge International A and AS Level components and some Cambridge O Level components.

This document consists of **15** printed pages.

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptors for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1:

Marks must be awarded in line with:

- the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question
- the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question
- the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2:

Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3:

Marks must be awarded **positively**:

- marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate
- marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do
- marks are not deducted for errors
- marks are not deducted for omissions
- answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4:

Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5:

Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6:

Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

Generic Marking grids

These level descriptors address Assessment Objectives (AOs) 1 and 2, and should be used in conjunction with the indicative content for each question in the mark scheme.

Assessment Objectives

AO1: Knowledge and understanding

Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the specified topics and texts

AO2: Analysis and evaluation

Analyse and evaluate the specified topics and texts

Generic marking principles

- (a) Examiners should start at the lowest descriptor, if the answer meets all the criteria they should then move to the next level and so on. The Examiner should repeat this process until there is a match between the overall answer and the descriptor. Examiners should use a best-fit approach when deciding upon the level, it is possible for a different level to be chosen for each AO.
- (b) If the Examiner identifies all aspects of the level descriptor within the answer then the highest mark for the level should be given. Examiners should also make reference to the indicative content when deciding on the mark within a level to ensure that there is sufficient relevant content evident within the answer for the level and mark. Examiners should be prepared to credit material in answers which is not contained in the indicative content.
- (c) The Examiner may need to make a judgement within a level or between two or more level statements. Once a 'best-fit' level statement has been identified, use the following guidance to decide on a specific mark:
 - Where the candidate's work **convincingly** meets the level statement, you should award the highest mark.
 - Where the candidate's work **adequately** meets the level statement, you should award the most appropriate mark in the middle of the range.
 - Where the candidate's work **just** meets the level statement, you should award the lowest mark.

A Level Marking grid

Level	AO1 Knowledge and Understanding	Marks
Level 4	<p>Explorative with detailed significant knowledge</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of detailed and relevant knowledge. • Confident understanding demonstrated through making connections between ideas and development of discussion. • Addresses all aspects of the question. • Exploration of the wider context if relevant. 	10–12
Level 3	<p>Explains significance of knowledge</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of accurate and relevant knowledge. • Good understanding demonstrated through explanation of significance of knowledge used in developing the discussion. • Addresses most aspects of the question. • Good understanding of the wider context, if relevant. 	7–9
Level 2	<p>Range of knowledge partly addressing the question</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of knowledge with some accuracy • Demonstrates understanding through use of appropriate knowledge, may be less well developed • Partially addresses the question. • Uneven engagement with the wider context, if relevant. 	4–6
Level 1	<p>Limited answer to question with limited knowledge / understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifies a limited range of knowledge some of which may not be accurate. • Demonstrates basic understanding • Response is relevant to the topic, but does not directly address the question. • Limited reference to the wider context, if relevant 	1–3
Level 0	No relevant material to credit.	0

Level	AO2 Analysis and Evaluation	Marks
Level 5	<p>Assesses alternative conclusions with analysis of points view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyses the importance and/or strength of different points of view. Uses accurate evidence to support a coherent and well-structured discussion. Coherent conclusion which evaluates knowledge and points of view and assesses alternative conclusions. 	16–18
Level 4	<p>Coherent conclusion supported by evidenced points of view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discusses different points of view in some detail. Uses accurate evidence to support a well-structured discussion. Coherent conclusion which evaluates knowledge and points of view 	12–15
Level 3	<p>Clear conclusion with different points of view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recognises different points of view and discusses at least one in some detail. Uses accurate evidence to support discussion. Clear conclusion to the question which is linked to a range of knowledge and points of view. 	8–11
Level 2	<p>Attempts conclusion with a supported point of view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discusses one point of view Uses supporting evidence for one or more relevant point. The support may not be wholly relevant or accurate. Attempts a conclusion to the question which is linked to knowledge and/or a point of view. 	4–7
Level 1	<p>Basic conclusion with a point of view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> States a point of view. Little or no supporting evidence. Attempts a basic conclusion. 	1–3
Level 0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No relevant material to credit. 	0

Section A

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	<p>Explain how the practices of Sathya Sai International Organisation might help members to be devoted to the divine within.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and understanding. Responses will be marked according to the 12 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>The Sathya Sai International Organisation (SSIO) describes itself as a non-denominational voluntary organisation, whose members all share the goal of realising the divine within themselves. The central aim of the organisation is to help people become aware of the divine within themselves and also within others, as well as to live in accordance with that recognition. It promotes the principles of dharma, satya (truth), shanti (peace), prema (love) and ahimsa (harmlessness) in and through human relationships. All this, and the practices which promote and support these principles, are based on the teaching of Sathya Sai Baba, the founder of the organisation.</p> <p>Sai Baba summarised his teaching as “love all, serve all”. Members of the organisation are not encouraged to reject or withdraw from the world like monks or ascetics but to remain in the world, serving humanity as a whole. The world is regarded as the classroom in which people can learn the ultimate truth of their nature and by living according to the five ethical values people are enabled to connect with God. Three core pathways were identified by Sai Baba as leading to this goal—karma (action), bhakti (devotion) and jnana (wisdom). All three are considered important and the regular practices of members, including chanting/devotional singing, seva (selfless service) and studying the writings of Sai Baba reflect the central importance of connecting with the divine, both within and outside of oneself.</p> <p>The organisation runs centres where devotees can pursue bhakti and jnana through communal worship and organised study. These centres also facilitate karma by organising the voluntary and charitable efforts and programmes of SSIO, which include food distribution, free education and medical services. The charitable activities of the organisation, carried out by its members, are regarded as seva. All service is, ultimately offered to God, but the individual realises their own divinity through such selfless offering because it enables them to let go of worldly desires and distractions which hide the truth. By focusing on virtuous, ethical living and clearing the mind of detachment the way is opened for divine grace to bestow realisation of the truth on the individual.</p>	12

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	<p>‘New Religious Movements have greater influence on non-Hindu views of the religion than traditional Hinduism.’ Discuss.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and evaluation. Responses will be marked according to the 18 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Hinduism is an extremely diverse religion with uncertain and ancient origins; even scholars of the religion are unlikely to have a clear picture of every possible expression of it and this complexity might, in itself, lead people to seek the relative simplicity of a New Religious Movement (NRM) when looking to understand Hinduism. Hinduism is sufficiently diverse that some scholars do not consider it a single religion at all. It is also the case that ‘religion’ is itself subject to various definitions and not every expression of Hinduism will conform to every possible definition of religion. By contrast NRMs are often more clearly related to the popular understandings of what religion is and therefore could be judged to be more useful to a non-Hindu seeking an introduction to Hinduism.</p> <p>In general terms however, Hinduism is recognised as a religion, involving beliefs and practices, and addressing ethical, spiritual and/or metaphysical concerns. It is taught about in schools and religious studies departments and is represented in popular culture. These various perceptions of the religion are influenced by the contact the people producing and sharing them have had with Hinduism in its various forms. In places where Hinduism is widespread or a majority religion, people may be more likely to be familiar with different forms of it. However, it is also true that what is visible in terms of religious practice is only part of what there is to know about any religion.</p> <p>In terms of visibility, new religious movements are probably better known in many places outside India than the more traditional forms of the religion because they are more likely to actively proselytise and promote themselves. If part of the teaching of an NRM is that their teachings are the true, pure or original form of something, and that interpretation is the first one a person has encountered, then their perception of other forms and interpretations is likely to be influenced by this first encounter.</p>	18

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	<p>Whether NRMs influence the view of Hinduism held by non-Hindus is likely to be at least partly connected with how explicitly the NRMs connect themselves with Hinduism more broadly. While both ISKCON and SSIO actively work beyond their own communities and proselytise teachings and a way of life considered by members to be universally applicable they do not make the same claims about Hinduism. ISKCON considers itself to be Hindu, and actively seeks to educate people about Hinduism via its own teachings and interpretation of Hindu principles. By contrast the SSIO describes itself as non-denominational, and as teaching a universal truth and practice equally relevant to adherents of all religions or none. If a new member were familiar with Hinduism and/or Hindu philosophical concepts the connection is likely to be obvious, but since the organisation explicitly distances itself from any single religious tradition, casting it purely as a form of Hinduism is likely to be controversial. Nevertheless, there are aspects of traditional Hinduism that are drawn upon by the NRMs such as the importance of the guru and practices such as devotion (bhakti), non-violence (ahimsa) and service (seva) to others and the community.</p>	

Question	Answer	Marks
2(a)	<p>Explain the reasons for the rise of the Hindutva movement.</p> <p>AO1– Knowledge and understanding. Responses will be marked according to the 12 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Hindutva means ‘Hinduness’, and the term is associated with Hindu nationalism; despite the similarity of the words, Hindutva is not a synonym for the religion of Hinduism but a broader term, relating an extremely broad understanding of what Hindu religion is to the idea of a Hindu culture that, Hindutva thinkers argue, is shared by all the religious traditions originating in India. Supporters of this perspective hold the view that India is a homeland for Hindus, with Hinduism usually being considered to include Buddhism, Jainism and Sikhism, since they are of Indic origin. By extension, practitioners of other religions which originated outside India, and/or people rooted in non-Hindu cultures cannot be properly considered Indian according to Hindutva views, regardless of how long representatives of those cultures have lived in the country.</p> <p>The term ‘Hindutva’ first became popular in the 1920s with the publication of ‘Hindutva: Who is a Hindu?’, a political pamphlet written by independence campaigner Vinayak Damodar Savarkar. The pamphlet lays the foundation for the modern Hindutva ideology, presenting Hinduism as a cultural, political and ethnic identity that can be claimed by people for whom India is the place where their ancestors lived and the place of origin of their religion (thus including all Indian religions as Hindu). He advocated the creation of an independent state of India based on such an identity.</p> <p>The movement became popular for a variety of reasons. Initially, as part of the campaign for independence the idea of a Hindu ethnicity or nation gained popularity as it explicitly challenged the right of non-Hindus to rule India. It was also popular with those who felt their religion and/or their cultural traditions were under threat from foreign—meaning not of Indian origin—cultural influences regardless of who ruled the country and it is arguably this which continues to fuel the movement today in an increasingly globalised world. Political parties influenced by Hindutva have presented themselves as non-corrupt and pure in comparison to other ‘non-Hindu’ entities and are able to appeal to the nostalgia for a lost ‘golden age’ which seems to fuel many forms of nationalism.</p>	12

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	<p>Assess the claim that Hindu fundamentalism is a recent development.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and evaluation. Responses will be marked according to the 18 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Hindutva is a term often considered interchangeable with Hindu fundamentalism, although because the relationship between religion and Hindutva is complicated, this connection might not be universally agreed upon. In the broadest sense, fundamentalism describes a strict and literal adherence to a specific set of principles considered basic or foundational. Hinduism’s diversity could be said to make a fundamentalist view difficult to sustain. In a religious context, fundamentalism is often associated with the literalist reading of scriptures, but this tends to be less of a concern for most groups that have been described as fundamentalist Hindu. Other areas on which fundamentalist groups tend to focus might be the role and status of women and minority groups, upholding traditional ethical values and practices and/or protecting places of importance to Hindus from perceived threats.</p> <p>The designation of Hindutva as a form of fundamentalism supports the view that this is a recent development, since Hindutva has only been a significant social and political movement for about a century. The prominent Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) is associated with Hindutva, although it does not overtly argue for the state of India to become a Hindu nation. It does, however, oppose proselytisation by Christians and Muslims and tensions between Hindus and Muslims living in India are fed by the Hindutva view of Islam as inherently alien (not of Indian origin). Whether or not such tensions are recent or have worsened in recent history is more debatable.</p> <p>Many contemporary scholars of Hinduism, and Hindus themselves, hold the view that Hinduism as a religion is essentially pluralistic and so accepting of diversity as to make fundamentalism a virtual impossibility. This view, which incorporates the concept of Hinduism as the Sanatana Dharma (eternal dharma) and of all religions as leading to the same universal truth, is of modern origin, arising from Hindu responses to Christianity and Western thought more generally. This is sometimes called a neo-Hindu perspective, which views Hinduism as a universal religion based on general ethical principles, and it is in contrast to views of Hinduism as comprising a core essential element such as accepting the divine origin of the Vedas. Traditional forms of Hinduism would regard non-Hindus as outside of the caste system, implying a basic distinction between Hindus and non-Hindus. Neo-Hinduism is often also distinguished from the traditional Brahminical Hinduism, which emphasises svadharma arising from varna and ashrama. If this distinction is maintained and traditional Hinduism regarded as fundamental then fundamentalism in a Hindu context is clearly not of modern origin, although it is unlikely to have been called by that name until contemporary times.</p>	18

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	Fundamentalism of all kinds is usually understood to be a response to a perceived threat to something of value. In the context of religion, including Hinduism, it is an attempt to reclaim or revive a pure or more authentic form of the religion, or what is perceived to be such. For Hinduism this often draws upon the Vedas and astika darshanas.	

Question	Answer	Marks
3	<p>'Hinduism has always promoted feminist values.' Discuss this claim.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and understanding AO2 – Analysis and evaluation Responses will be marked according to the level descriptors.</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Feminism is commonly used to describe social or political movements and campaigns focused on gender equality, usually to do with the rights and freedoms of women and girls. Most feminists argue that society remains, even today, biased against women in its attitudes and values and that this is the case even where there are well established equality laws to prevent it. Such laws are generally very recent in historical terms and have commonly been introduced as a response to widespread practices and attitudes that are damaging to women—such as sati, dowries and the treatment of widows—which had been considered normal and/or natural, or even virtuous, until recent times.</p> <p>The central value underpinning feminist attitudes is that of equality: feminists believe that men and women are equal and should be treated equally in all circumstances. Equality may refer to independence from men and traditional limitations or controls upon women. It might also seek to extend Hindu ideas traditionally associated with or focused upon male lives, such as the ashramas, so that they include women. Another way to understand equality is in terms of giving equal value or status to the different roles traditionally associated with gender. This 'equal but different' stance is often considered non-feminist by people who do not hold it, since it can be used to justify restricting women to the traditional spheres of home and family, but many people who do hold it would consider themselves feminists. In this view icons of traditional femininity such as Sita can be claimed by feminists as role models, demonstrating the qualities of the ideal or perfect wife. Other feminists would challenge the idea that there are specifically female virtues, or that women's behaviour in any given situation can be judged differently to that of men.</p> <p>Many feminists champion the equality of other minority groups as well. Feminism also commonly promotes other values broadly associated with equality, such as tolerance, respect, justice and honesty. It is important to note, however, that there is no universally agreed definition of feminism and no single shared ideology to which all feminists subscribe, beyond the view that societies prioritise men and male perspectives.</p>	30

3	<p>It would be challenging to find religious sources which explicitly categorise men as superior to women and men's concerns as more important than women's, but this perspective can be seen as implicit in sources that depict women as under the control of men, less capable than men or as restricted in their spheres of concern and/or opportunities for education, work, religious practice etc. Hinduism does include teachings of this kind within its aegis; the Manusmriti, in particular can, be argued as depicting women as being of lower status/lesser importance than men. Other popular texts, like the Ramayana, depict important and beloved female characters but ascribe to them very different qualities and judge them according to different criteria of virtue than the male characters. This could be used to support an argument that Hinduism regards men and women differently but still considers them equals, but it could also be used as evidence of inequality in the religion's views of gender and gender roles.</p> <p>The fact that within Hinduism deity takes both male and female form, and goddesses can be independently worshipped is often used to support claims that Hinduism is inherently a feminist religion. As aspects of Devi goddesses can be either (or both) nurturing and fearsome. From a feminist perspective the idea that women can be more than simply care-givers—epitomising traditionally feminine qualities like gentleness and compassion – is important. Through the fiercer deities like Kali and Durga, Hinduism clearly recognises that women can be fierce, formidable and independent of male authority. While goddesses are usually cast primarily by scholars as one or the other – terrible or benevolent—for devotees they often encompass both elements. Feminists could argue that the complex nature of these deities shows that women do not have to choose between these two qualities, but can encompass both and more, while still remaining female. It is also worth noting that Durga in particular exists because of a problem, the buffalo demon Mahisha, which the male deities could not solve. However, while she had the power they did not, her weapons were given to her by male deities making the issue of the origins of her power more complex.</p> <p>While it is true that goddesses are the consorts of male deities, and some of them at least are traditionally depicted as subservient to men, it is also the case that Hindu philosophy recognises the complementary nature of the masculine and the feminine. In this view the goddess is the possessor of Shakti, the source of active power for the male deity who is her consort. However, for most Hindus, Shakti exists in balance with Shiva (masculine energy) with both being equal and necessary. It could be argued that as the active energy in this duality Shakti is superior or more important than Shiva. Shaktism is a religious tradition that regards the Goddess as the supreme form of divinity. However, the idea that masculine and feminine powers are interdependent is probably closer to the mainstream feminist position of equality. Purusha and prakriti are also conceptually divided into interdependent masculine and feminine forms of power. There are also feminists who might object to the idea that there is any inherent distinction between masculine and feminine power, or that specific forms of energy/power should be associated with a particular gender.</p>	
---	---	--

4	<p>Analyse the claim that dalit conversions to Buddhism did not contribute to reform of the caste system.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and understanding AO2 – Analysis and evaluation Responses will be marked according to the level descriptors.</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>The caste system is the generic name given to the organisation of society into castes, or classes. It is usually understood to be a hierarchical system with membership of a high caste signifying greater status and privilege than lower caste. India is often used as an example of such a system, with the Hindu varnas being considered to be the origins of the many modern-day castes. This is a disputed claim though, with many arguing that caste, which is a position assigned by birth, is better translated as jati; varna is better translated as ‘class’ and, according to many Hindus, is a status bestowed by aptitude or personal qualities rather than birth.</p> <p>The major ethical concern associated with the caste system is discrimination and even persecution of those individuals perceived as being of lower caste. Over time, Indian society developed an underclass of people who are ‘avarna’ (without varna), considered to be ritually unclean and therefore literally ‘untouchable’ by people of higher caste. If this view of members of such social groups is rooted wholly in religious concepts of purity and contamination, then rejecting the religion which holds that view is an understandable step. However, it is debatable whether the social discrimination encountered by dalits does in fact disappear when they are not Hindu by religion, or whether social status is informed by a wider range of factors.</p> <p>The Dalit Buddhist Movement argues that conversion is the solution to caste discrimination, following the view of the movements founder, Dr B R Ambedkar. He believed that the concept of untouchability was embedded within Hinduism, most specifically through the teachings of the Manusmriti (which he encouraged dalits to burn). It was therefore impossible to avoid it while remaining a Hindu, but not being a Hindu should remove one from the system and therefore solve the problem. However, it could also be argued that being outside the system carries its own form of uncleanness or untouchability and also that discrimination can result purely from being an ‘outcaste’ rather than because of membership of a specific group.</p>	30
---	--	-----------

4	<p>While some dalits supported conversion to Buddhism as part of the Adi Dharm movement in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the mass push for conversion known as the Dalit Buddhist Movement was started in late 1950s. B R Ambedkar, a dalit campaigner for social justice who had experienced widespread discrimination, converted to Buddhism in a public ceremony in 1956. A large number of his supporters, maybe as many as half a million, converted immediately after him and many (although not all) were also dalits. Ambedkar's converts took 22 vows, several of which explicitly rejected belief in aspects of Hinduism or observance of Hindu practices, including allowing brahmins to officiate at religious ceremonies. Ambedkar hoped the movement would gain mass support among dalits, as he believed it was the only way they could be free of prejudice. However, he died in the same year as completing his own conversion and the movement lost momentum and unified focus.</p> <p>Ambedkar announced his intention to convert almost twenty years before actually doing so. During the intervening time he studied Buddhism in depth and rejected a number of its core beliefs, including the Four Noble Truths (he found such teaching pessimistic). He reinterpreted the Buddha's teachings as being concerned with peace and social justice, presenting nirvana as a state on earth wherein people are freed from discrimination and hardship and therefore able to create happiness for themselves. He called his interpretation Navayana (new vehicle) and the majority of India's Buddhists affiliate themselves with this path. Since Ambedkar's death there have been several mass conversions, although not exclusively among dalits; numbers of converts at such events are unclear.</p> <p>What is also open to debate is whether the Navayana, which explicitly rejects concepts central to other forms of Buddhism, can be considered Buddhist at all.</p> <p>Other reformers worked across the same period of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries to address the social inequality of dalits, seeking to do so without encouraging conversion away from Hinduism. Swami Dayananda in particular sought to bring non-Hindu dalits back into Hinduism, a process that became known as 'shuddhi' (purification). This was a direct response to Christian and Muslim evangelisation, but viewed more broadly, it supports the view that religious conversion away from Hinduism did not solve the problem of untouchability.</p> <p>Even if active discrimination is reduced or removed by religious conversion, such action does nothing to alleviate poverty, malnutrition, lack of education and other sources of social injustice and human misery. It could be argued that without a corresponding social reform to tackle such issues conversion does little of practical value. Certainly, the conversions to Buddhism did not solve these social problems. Such social reforms have been attempted by Hindu groups and leaders in recent history, including the Brahma Samaj and M K Gandhi, and yet caste remains an issue in the contemporary world. This may be an indication that it is too deeply embedded in both society and religion to remove or simply that the right ways to achieve change have not yet been put in place.</p>	
---	---	--