



ADVANCED
General Certificate of Education
2016

Religious Studies
Assessment Unit A2 5
assessing

A study of the development and impact of the
Celtic Church in the 5th, 6th and 7th centuries

[AR251]

FRIDAY 27 MAY, MORNING

MARK
SCHEME

GCE Religious Studies

A2 Mark Scheme (A2 1 – A2 8)

Levels of Response

The specification requires that candidates demonstrate the following assessment objectives in the context of the learning outcomes and skills set out in the specification.

- Select and demonstrate clearly relevant knowledge and understanding through the use of evidence, examples and correct language and terminology appropriate to the course of study.

In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the connections between different elements of their course of study.

- Critically evaluate and justify a point of view through the use of evidence and reasoned argument.

In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should relate elements of their course of study to their broader context and to aspects of human experience.

Each of the two assessment objectives has been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective listed opposite, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

A2 BANDS**AO1 (30 marks)**

<p>Band 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A full and highly informed response to the task • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and accurate knowledge • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A very sophisticated style of writing set within a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology • An almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	25–30
<p>Band 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable and well informed response to the task • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature style of writing set within a mainly clear and coherent structure • A wide range of technical language and terminology • A mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	19–24
<p>Band 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the task • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature style of writing with some coherent structure evident • A good range of technical language and terminology • Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	13–18
<p>Band 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the task • Demonstrates some knowledge and understanding • A basic range of evidence and/or examples • Style of writing is just appropriate • Structure is disorganised in places • Limited range of technical language and terminology • Limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7–12
<p>Band 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very basic response to the task • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • Inappropriate style of writing within a poor structure • A very basic range of technical language and terminology • Very poor use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	0–6

AO2 (20 marks)

<p>Band 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis, supported by a high awareness of scholarly views • Very good personal insight and independent thought expressed through a highly developed argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience • An extensive range of technical language and terminology • An almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	17–20
<p>Band 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis, supported by a good awareness of scholarly views • Good personal insight and independent thought expressed through a developed argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience • A wide range of technical language and terminology • A mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	13–16
<p>Band 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis, supported by an awareness of the views of some scholars • Some personal insight and independent thought expressed through reasonable argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience • A good range of technical language and terminology • Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	9–12
<p>Band 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis, with limited awareness of scholarly views • Limited personal insight and independent thought expressed through some argument • A good range of technical language and terminology • Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	5–8
<p>Band 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis, with minimal awareness of scholarly views • Poor personal insight and/or independent thought • Shallow argument • Limited range of technical language and terminology • Limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	0–4

Section A

AVAILABLE
MARKS

- 1 (a) An outline and examination of the problems associated with the dating and geography of the historical Patrick could include, e.g.:
- limited sources and contradictory evidence of sources
 - no dates in Patrick's writings
 - awareness of death dates leading to different interpretations
 - chronology of Patrick/Palladius overlap
 - some dates collated from sources and interpreted by scholars such as 432–493, 432–461, 461–493, 456–493, 350–430
 - problems associated with geographical references, e.g. Bannavem Taburniae, Silva Focluti, Gaul
 - awareness of interpretations and problems of each location dealing with Patrick's birthplace, place of captivity and place of clerical training
 - awareness of debate over each location involving assumptions and not being conclusive
 - views of scholars such as Hanson, Bieler, Charles-Thomas [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the view that in spite of the historical difficulties surrounding Patrick, his standing as the founder of Christianity in Ireland is not diminished may include, e.g.:
- scarce documentation has encouraged research and clarification into Patrick's life
 - motivates and inspires further research into the time of Patrick
 - there may be difficulties surrounding the historical Patrick but we have two letters which almost everyone regards as authentic
 - invites analysis of internal/external evidence
 - lends a certain mystique to his life
 - highlights a complex figure
 - strengthens the idea of an historical Patrick
 - highlights Patrick as a pioneer in the evangelisation of Ireland
 - awareness of Patrick's characteristics required to evangelise
 - awareness of missionary requirements of handling people as well as those in authority
 - awareness of the input of Palladius and the possibility that Palladius was written out of the historical record
 - the possibility that there may have been other missionaries to Ireland and some have challenged Patrick's standing as founder
 - debate presents more problems than it solves such as the number of Patricks
 - controversy tends to undermine devotion to Patrick as a saint
 - scepticism over sources detracts from the picture of Patrick that is presented by the Church
 - presents a view that traditional history is wrong [20]

50

- 2 (a) An explanation and consideration of the statement could include, e.g.:
- specific reference to the statement with perhaps references to visions, prophecies, miracles and what it was that brought about this construction
 - awareness of background to hagiographical writings
 - awareness of other reasons for writing such as to promote interest in a church
 - supplies information about the time it was written
 - concern for nature and animals
 - Adomnán wrote for the community to show Colmcille (Columba) as an important abbot and his life as a monk
 - the writing would bolster morale in the community
 - reminding all that Colmcille was a kinsman of the Uí Néill
 - awareness of a clear-cut historical personality
 - the exceptional nature of this document which had no exaggerated claims, unlike other hagiographical writings
 - prophetic revelations such as regarding Ernene, Cormac, sons of King Aidan
 - miracles such as wine formed from water, driving out a demon
 - angelic visitations such as the bright pillar glowing upon the saint's head
 - concern with Colmcille and successes
 - little concern with missionary endeavours
 - encouragement to maintain faith
 - references and examples from other relevant texts
 - consideration of the quotation in relation to Adomnán's life of Colmcille
 - views of scholars such as Gougaud, Sharpe, Picard [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the value and importance of hagiographical writings may include, e.g.:
- the use of reliable sources such as Patrick's Confessio
 - awareness of additional social and political information such as the Church in Kildare
 - awareness of incidental information on kings and battles
 - awareness of spread of tribal power
 - supplies atmosphere of the time
 - movement between factual and legendary information
 - legends and myths of saint
 - facts can be entangled from legendary material
 - priority given to the religious value of information
 - information can be seen about the time in which the life was written rather than the time of the saint
 - reference may be made to political issues of the author's time
 - little detailed historical or biographical information on the saint
 - limited information on the saint's family background
 - details may be deliberately exaggerated
 - time lapse between saint's death and the writing such as two hundred years in the case of Patrick's Life
 - alternatively these writings are historically worthless
 - possible reference to J. McMasters' view of hagiography as 'myth theology'
 - views of scholars such as K. Hughes, Ó Cróinín and possible reference to Walsh and Bradley [20]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

- 3 (a) An identification and consideration of the contribution of the Two Rules of Columbanus to the development of monasticism could include, e.g.:
- awareness of Monks' Rule and Community Rule
 - the Monks' Rule outlined the virtues and attitudes expected of Monks
 - the Community Rule lay down structures and routines of the daily life of a Monk with penalties for breach of Rule
 - the Rules were similar to the Rule of Comgall at Bangor
 - some, obedience and discretion, copied from other rules, Cassian and Basil, but bearing characteristics of Columbanus
 - awareness of contribution to daily routine of a monk
 - formalised constitution of monastic life and brought it to the continent
 - routine structure of daily life as well as penalties
 - examples of strictness such as the recitation of 330 psalms each night
 - no relaxation of rules for the sick
 - detailed recitation of the Divine Office
 - possible reference to the Benedictine Rule
 - views of scholars such as Ó Fiaich, Metlake, Walsh and Bradley [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the view that the monastic discipline of the type advocated by Columbanus is irrelevant to people today may include, e.g.:
- awareness of the extreme measures
 - focus on absolute obedience
 - least deviation from Rule resulted in corporal punishment
 - absolute authority of leader, the abbot
 - could be considered as contrary to human rights
 - issues in rules could be used as a reforming process
 - defends traditional moral values
 - no growth without discipline
 - while out of date, the principles are relevant with reference to obedience, power, chastity and living in community
 - the overall message is timeless
 - rules are universal and can be adapted
 - practice of monasticism in other world religions
 - possible reference to Lough Derg and other place of puritanical pilgrimage, e.g. Croagh Patrick [20]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

- 4 (a) An analysis and discussion of the validity of the claims of Armagh could include, e.g.:
- awareness of the claims and Book of Angel
 - employment of various tactics to support claims such as lawyers, hagiographers, Paschal controversy
 - organised propaganda process to strengthen claim
 - ecclesiastical power struggle with Kildare
 - no legal support for Armagh as court of appeal
 - evidence of a redactor
 - order of signatures is suspect
 - awareness of reliability of annalistic evidence
 - supportive evidence of letter from Pope Elect, list of ecclesiastical and civil leaders
 - views of scholars such as Ó Fiaich, Walsh and Bradley, K. Hughes
- [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the claim that disputes over authority and leadership continue to damage the Church may include, e.g.:
- candidates may provide and discuss examples of disputes over authority and leadership leading to damage or strength of church/ community
 - very specific contemporary difficulties about disputes such as source of authority, women in ministry, autocratic leadership
 - educated population questioning political agendas of disputants
 - community turning away from religion as they see the clergy fighting for materialistic power
 - awareness of consequences of divisions and setting up of other alternatives
 - aim of uniformity will strengthen church
 - strengthen bureaucratic process
 - allows individual conscience and democracy to be used
 - allows free discussion and transparency to community
 - the importance that is being attached to discernment (Pope Francis) and primacy of conscience
- [20]

Section A

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

100

GCE Religious Studies

A2 Mark Scheme (A2 1 – A2 8)

Synoptic Assessment

Levels of Response

The specification requires that candidates demonstrate the following assessment objectives in the context of the learning outcomes and skills set out in the specification.

- Select and demonstrate clearly relevant knowledge and understanding through the use of evidence, examples, and correct language and terminology appropriate to the course of study. In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the connections between different elements of their course of study.
- Critically evaluate and justify a point of view through the use of evidence and reasoned argument. In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should relate elements of their course of study to their broader context and to aspects of human experience.

Each of the two assessment objectives has been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates.

Having identified, for each assessment objective listed opposite, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

It is important that in the marking of the synoptic assessment unit, assistant examiners take account of the candidate's abilities in drawing together strands of knowledge and understanding from at least two different content areas.

Using the chosen theme, candidates will be expected to explore connections between elements of the selected areas of study. They should make appropriate use of the content as set out in the subject content for each module.

The five strands of knowledge and understanding act as a common and unifying structure for the specification. These are:

- the key concepts within the chosen areas of study, (e.g. religious beliefs, teachings, doctrines, principles, ideas and theories) and how these are expressed in texts, writings and/or practices
- the contribution of significant people, tradition or movements to the areas studied
- religious language and terminology
- major issues and questions arising from the chosen areas of study
- the relationship between the chosen areas of study and other specified aspects of human experience

In particular candidates should demonstrate the ability to relate such connections to other aspects of human experience.

A2 BANDS**AO1 (30 marks)**

<p>Band 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A full and comprehensive understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme • Well integrated response • Clear and critical analysis • Highly accurate use of evidence and examples • Sophisticated style of writing. Very well structured and coherent throughout. 	25–30
<p>Band 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A high degree of understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme • A well integrated response • Some very good critical analysis • Mainly accurate use of evidence and examples • Mature style of writing • Well structured and coherent throughout. 	19–24
<p>Band 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme • For the most part an integrated response • Reasonable degree of critical analysis • A good degree of accurate evidence and examples • Reasonably mature style of writing • Some evidence of good structure and coherence. 	13–18
<p>Band 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme • Mere juxtaposition of the two areas of study, perhaps emphasising one content area at the expense of another • A limited attempt at critical analysis • Insufficient use of accurate evidence and examples • Immature style of writing • Lacking in structure and coherence. 	7–12
<p>Band 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme • Demonstrating only partially accurate knowledge of the different content areas studied • Little attempt, if any, at critical analysis • Inappropriate style of writing with a very basic structure. 	0–6

AO2 (20 marks)

<p>Band 5</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience • Very effective comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints • Mature personal insight and independent thought • A very well sustained and critical argument, expressed accurately and fluently with considerable sophistication using a wide range of terminology. 	17–20
<p>Band 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience • Very good comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints • Good personal insight and independent thought • A well sustained and critical argument, expressed accurately, fluently and using a range of terminology. 	13–16
<p>Band 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience • Very good comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints • Some evidence of personal insight and independent thought • A line of argument, expressed accurately and using some relevant terminology. 	9–12
<p>Band 2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience • Some comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints • Limited personal insight and independent thought • Little evidence of critical argument • Inaccuracies evident. 	5–8
<p>Band 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience • Little, if any, comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints • Minimal personal insight and independent thought • A basic attempt to follow a line of argument • Imprecisely expressed. 	0–4

Section B

Synoptic Assessment

Theme: Holiness

You **must** answer this question

- 5 (a) An outline and examination of the major issues in relation to the idea of holiness could include, e.g.:
- reference to at least two areas of study
 - interpretation of holiness and religious holiness as a perfection of God in both areas of study
 - definition of the role of holiness
 - references to some relevant issues
 - references to the call to holiness, conversion caused by holiness, nature of holiness, women and holiness, challenges presented by holiness, forgiveness as related to holiness
 - impact on lifestyles and decisions
 - maintenance of holy status
 - need for adherence to social ethical behaviour
 - awareness of sense of obedience to the law, leadership
 - holiness resulting in personal/community suffering and conflict
 - rigours of an ethical and holy lifestyle causing sacrifice and exile [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the view holiness is only achieved through personal faith in God may include, e.g.:
- an open-ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples with reference to other aspects of human experience
 - reference to scriptural examples of individual/collective holiness
 - requirement to “love God, love neighbour”
 - modern emphasis on individual relationship with God, another way is to do things because of love of God
 - individual holiness could be seen as a retreat from reality
 - this style of holiness can fail to respond to needs of others
 - holiness exists in community such as the Trinity
 - community can support and motivate
 - holiness is worked out in community expressing loving relationship to each other
 - possible references to other religious beliefs and practices as illustrative of holiness [20]

Section B

Total

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

50

150