



*Rewarding Learning*

**ADVANCED**  
**General Certificate of Education**  
**2017**

---

## **Religious Studies**

**Assessment Unit A2 5**

*assessing*

A Study of the Development and Impact of the  
Celtic Church in the 5th, 6th and 7th Centuries

**[AR251]**

**THURSDAY 22 JUNE, AFTERNOON**

---

**MARK  
SCHEME**

## GCE Religious Studies

### A2 Mark Scheme (A2 1 – A2 8)

#### Levels of Response

The specification requires that candidates demonstrate the following assessment objectives in the context of the learning outcomes and skills set out in the specification.

- Select and demonstrate clearly relevant knowledge and understanding through the use of evidence, examples and correct language and terminology appropriate to the course of study.

In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the connections between different elements of their course of study.

- Critically evaluate and justify a point of view through the use of evidence and reasoned argument.

In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should relate elements of their course of study to their broader context and to aspects of human experience.

Each of the two assessment objectives has been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective listed opposite, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

**A2 BANDS****AO1 (30 marks)**

<p><b>Band 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A full and highly informed response to the task</li> <li>• Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and accurate knowledge</li> <li>• A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A very sophisticated style of writing set within a clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• An extensive range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• An almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>25–30</b>
<p><b>Band 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A reasonable and well informed response to the task</li> <li>• Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge</li> <li>• A very good range of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A mature style of writing set within a mainly clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• A wide range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• A mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>19–24</b>
<p><b>Band 3</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A good response to the task</li> <li>• Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge</li> <li>• A good range of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A reasonably mature style of writing with some coherent structure evident</li> <li>• A good range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>13–18</b>
<p><b>Band 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited response to the task</li> <li>• Demonstrates some knowledge and understanding</li> <li>• A basic range of evidence and/or examples</li> <li>• Style of writing is just appropriate</li> <li>• Structure is disorganised in places</li> <li>• Limited range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>7–12</b>
<p><b>Band 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A very basic response to the task</li> <li>• Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding</li> <li>• Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples</li> <li>• Inappropriate style of writing within a poor structure</li> <li>• A very basic range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Very poor use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>0–6</b>

## AO2 (20 marks)

<p><b>Band 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis, supported by a high awareness of scholarly views</li> <li>• Very good personal insight and independent thought expressed through a highly developed argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience</li> <li>• An extensive range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• An almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>17–20</b>
<p><b>Band 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis, supported by a good awareness of scholarly views</li> <li>• Good personal insight and independent thought expressed through a developed argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A wide range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• A mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>13–16</b>
<p><b>Band 3</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis, supported by an awareness of the views of some scholars</li> <li>• Some personal insight and independent thought expressed through reasonable argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of wider aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A good range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>9–12</b>
<p><b>Band 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis, with limited awareness of scholarly views</li> <li>• Limited personal insight and independent thought expressed through some argument</li> <li>• A good range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>5–8</b>
<p><b>Band 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A very basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis, with minimal awareness of scholarly views</li> <li>• Poor personal insight and/or independent thought</li> <li>• Shallow argument</li> <li>• Limited range of technical language and terminology</li> <li>• Limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar.</li> </ul>	<b>0–4</b>

## Section A

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

- 1 (a) An examination of the issues surrounding the Patrician authorship of **The First Synod of Patrick** could include, e.g.:
- traditional acceptance that Patrick wrote *The Letter to Coroticus* and the *Confessio*
  - **The First Synod of Patrick** is a circular letter written to the clergy of Ireland by the Bishops Patricius, Auxilius and Iserninus
  - it is the earliest surviving document concerning ecclesiastical discipline in Ireland
  - the document is about the organisation of the Church and regulating the behaviour of monks, clerics and laity within a structure of 34 Canons of which 17 deal with clerical discipline
  - debate arose over the historical situation that is assumed by the Canons and authorship
  - some argue for the authenticity or otherwise of the authors
  - an early stage of the Celtic Church as it clarified guidelines for the clergy such as Canon 34
  - paganism was still in evidence as no alms were to be accepted from pagans
  - viewed as documents of an early diocesan system and not a monastic system and seen as a composite work of other clergy and possibly issued with Patrick's approval
  - one view is that it is a product of Auxilius and Iserninus and Palladian Church in Leinster
  - dating of the Synod in 457 falls within the traditional dating of the Irish mission of Patrick
  - 14 Canons quoted under the name of Patricius in the *Collectio Hibernensis*
  - some debate over the style of Latin used if similar or not to the *Letter to Coroticus* and the *Confessio* – matter far from settled
  - Patrick did not mention Bishops
  - Irish Church could be viewed as being estranged from the British Church as exemplified by Canon 33
  - differing views for an infant Church as compared to a well organised second generation Church
  - evidence that monasticism existed as monks could only travel with the Abbot's permission
  - views of scholars such as K. Hughes, Bieler, Hadden and Stubbs [30]
- (b) A critical evaluation of the view that **The First Synod of Patrick** and **The Three Sayings of Patrick (Dicta Patricii)** have little relevance for the modern reader may include, e.g.:
- modern reader is more concerned with the present and has limited time for the past
  - the Sayings would probably hold very limited interest for the reader whereas the Canons may cause some debate
  - more concern for pragmatism than scholarly debate
  - controversy detracts from the picture of Patrick
  - awareness of outdated language
  - the documents are not contemporary topical debate and some specific items are not relevant such as penances of excommunication
  - an opinion that the documents are only for the religious

- only enhances the view that some traditional history teaching is inaccurate
- First Saying could be interpreted as the requirement for a European dimension to learning
- Third Saying adding a musical dimension to worship
- out of date yet the principles of discipline are relevant
- invites the person to peruse the evidence
- the general message of clarifying duties is always necessary
- awareness that there is no personal growth without clarification and guidelines
- married priests are an item for modern discussion
- laity involvement in services was in evidence and could be discussed and is still relevant
- there is a certain underlying pastoral dimension in the Canons [20]

AVAILABLE MARKS
50

- 2 (a) An analysis and discussion of the distinctive characteristics of the Celtic Church could include, e.g.:
- awareness of an episcopal Church that had been established by Patrick
  - boundaries of church were based on the boundaries of the tuath
  - centres of learning with love of poetry, music and art
  - open to accept innovation in areas such as Penitentials
  - structure was familiar rather than territorial
  - each monastic paruchia grew due to an increase in benefactors
  - gender inclusive as with Brigit and Ita
  - movement from an episcopal to a monastic system
  - change of governance from Bishop to the Abbott
  - asceticism was intensified to find spiritual perfection
  - there was evidence of underlying issues of a missionary Church
  - the community was centred within the tuath
  - preference for rural lifestyle combined with nature
  - much less authoritarian than within the Roman system
  - charismatic church of spiritual unity rather than universal uniformity
  - personal sanctity rather than doctrinal orthodoxy
  - views of scholars such as Ryan, Ó Cróinín, K. Hughes [30]
- (b) A critical evaluation of the view that life and practice in the Celtic Church was overtly ascetic and therefore, negative in character may include, e.g.:
- becoming more ascetic to achieve perfection with God – could be seen as a tendency to omit a human and social aspect to worship
  - references and examples of ascetic practices from monastic founders, e.g. prostrating without moving during 112 psalms – could be seen as unnecessary and unhealthy activities for an individual
  - awareness of the intention of perfection of the ascetic practice and not necessarily a focus on God – involving a focus on the individual's pride in achieving a physical act that could be seen by others
  - focus on absolute and unreserved obedience may lead to no need for human communication/responses
  - there exists a tendency to move from this world to another sphere – as a retreat from reality
  - alternatively the practices will bring oneself closer to God – as seen as a one dimensional element towards worship
  - the monk strives to become more Christlike – but may fail to respond to needs of others
  - the ascetic practices establish virtues such as patience and meekness – to the neglect of social and community based elements
  - frequent prayer becomes easy – to the neglect of community prayer
  - some individual characteristics are positively developed and enhanced such as empathy, self-control, discipline, capabilities and potential – possibly help within oneself to the detriment of their use within the community
  - views of scholars such as K. Hughes, Ó Cróinín and possible reference to Walsh and Bradley [20]

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

50

- 3 (a)** A case for and discussion of the view that Columbanus was Ireland's first European could include, e.g.:
- that given the difficulties of time involved in travel that such a missionary exploit was attempted shows how important Europe was for Columbanus
  - Columbanus saw Christianity as providing a common European identity
  - Evidence of other peregrini going to Europe but with limited success
  - seen as a typical representative of Irish monasticism on the continent
  - brought the Gospel to France, Switzerland and Italy
  - established monasteries in Annagray, Fontaines, Luxeuil, Bregenz and Bobbio
  - places of learning, holiness and choral music found on the ruins of old Roman forts
  - these became places of culture and spirituality attracting large numbers
  - the Roman empire, civil religion, symbols and values were in decline
  - Columbanus was constructing a new empire on the ruins of the old Roman Empire
  - his Rule was written on the continent and formalised the constitution of monastic life
  - very strict Rules such as there was no relaxation of Rules for the sick
  - controversy with French Bishops for not seeking approval for the monasteries
  - incident with King Theuderic led to banishment
  - brought private repeatable penance to Europe
  - 34 parishes in Northern Italy named in his honour
  - possible references to other saints in Europe such as Gall
  - views of scholars such as Ó Fiaich, Metlake and possible reference to Walsh and Bradley [30]
- (b)** A critical assessment of the claim that Columbanus is still an inspiration and role model for the modern-day Christian may include, e.g.:
- inspired others with his successful monasteries but his characteristics of being headstrong, impetuous, eager and passionate were a source of power and cause of mistakes
  - his handling of aristocracy and clerical hierarchy was impressive
  - was seen as a defender of moral values and faith
  - viewed as a strong defender of Celtic traditions
  - his overall message as a witness is timeless
  - his influence was due to conversions and to the Rule he imposed
  - his work was a prototype of missionary activity in Europe
  - was seen as being too controversial in his handling of people
  - the controversial issue of whether he should only have concerned himself with religious issues, but he did confront the political issues of his time
  - viewed as being too strict with no flexibility such as in the Rules
  - strong witness in spite of adversity to faith [20]

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

50

- 4 (a) Identification and discussion on the arguments of both parties at the Synod of Whitby could include, e.g.:
- Synod called in 663 or 664 to decide on the Paschal controversy for Easter to be celebrated on a fixed day of the lunar month or on the following Sunday
  - awareness of other different cultural variations such as tonsure, ordination of Bishops
  - clash of Celtic and Roman practices in the Northumbrian royalty
  - a view was that all Christian Churches in the civilised world should have the same structure and doctrine
  - Celtic Church cited the apostle John and his churches reinforced by the Holy men Anatolius and Columba in their defence
  - Roman view favoured the apostle Peter and Paul in that Easter would be celebrated on the Sabbath after the 14th day due to the Resurrection
  - awareness that John initially followed the Roman pattern, as do his followers in Asia, but accommodated the Mosaic law for a specific audience at a specific time
  - reference to the authority of individuals led to juxtaposing Columba with Peter to whom Jesus had given the keys of the kingdom
  - decision was acceptance of Roman practice
  - discussion on the coronal and frontal tonsure
  - episcopal ordination in the wider church involved three other Bishops
  - awareness of differences in baptism
  - views of scholars such as Gougaud, Rees and Kerr and possible reference to Walsh and Bradley [30]

- (b) A critical assessment of the claim that the Synod of Whitby had a positive impact on the Celtic Church may include, e.g.:
- Celtic reactions to conform took a long time
  - unification may have evolved without the Synod
  - South of Ireland conformed earlier so now all Ireland was eventually standardised
  - clarified Celtic allegiance to Papal authority
  - retained Celtic monastic structure and adjusted to native law
  - conformed slowly through lengthy discussions so all were involved
  - uniformity will strengthen the Celtic Church
  - Colman dejected and left Lindisfarne for Ireland
  - could be viewed as the ultimate death of the Celtic Church and led to the decline of the missionary movement
  - destroyed the spiritual leadership of the autonomous national church outside Roman control
  - capitulation to the power of Rome would erase any independent tradition outside Roman authority
  - tempered confidence in the power of the saints of the Celtic Church
  - Celtic influences were not as strong as before [20]

Section A

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

50

100

## GCE Religious Studies

### A2 Mark Scheme (A2 1 – A2 8)

#### Synoptic Assessment

#### Levels of Response

The specification requires that candidates demonstrate the following assessment objectives in the context of the learning outcomes and skills set out in the specification.

- Select and demonstrate clearly relevant knowledge and understanding through the use of evidence, examples, and correct language and terminology appropriate to the course of study. In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the connections between different elements of their course of study.
- Critically evaluate and justify a point of view through the use of evidence and reasoned argument. In addition, for synoptic assessment, A Level candidates should relate elements of their course of study to their broader context and to aspects of human experience.

Each of the two assessment objectives has been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates.

Having identified, for each assessment objective listed opposite, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

It is important that in the marking of the synoptic assessment unit, assistant examiners take account of the candidate's abilities in drawing together strands of knowledge and understanding from at least two different content areas.

Using the chosen theme, candidates will be expected to explore connections between elements of the selected areas of study. They should make appropriate use of the content as set out in the subject content for each module.

The five strands of knowledge and understanding act as a common and unifying structure for the specification. These are:

- the key concepts within the chosen areas of study, (e.g. religious beliefs, teachings, doctrines, principles, ideas and theories) and how these are expressed in texts, writings and/or practices
- the contribution of significant people, tradition or movements to the areas studied
- religious language and terminology
- major issues and questions arising from the chosen areas of study
- the relationship between the chosen areas of study and other specified aspects of human experience

In particular candidates should demonstrate the ability to relate such connections to other aspects of human experience.

**A2 BANDS****AO1 (30 marks)**

<p><b>Band 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A full and comprehensive understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme</li> <li>• Well integrated response</li> <li>• Clear and critical analysis</li> <li>• Highly accurate use of evidence and examples</li> <li>• Sophisticated style of writing. Very well structured and coherent throughout.</li> </ul>	<b>25–30</b>
<p><b>Band 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A high degree of understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme</li> <li>• A well integrated response</li> <li>• Some very good critical analysis</li> <li>• Mainly accurate use of evidence and examples</li> <li>• Mature style of writing</li> <li>• Well structured and coherent throughout.</li> </ul>	<b>19–24</b>
<p><b>Band 3</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A good understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme</li> <li>• For the most part an integrated response</li> <li>• Reasonable degree of critical analysis</li> <li>• A good degree of accurate evidence and examples</li> <li>• Reasonably mature style of writing</li> <li>• Some evidence of good structure and coherence.</li> </ul>	<b>13–18</b>
<p><b>Band 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme</li> <li>• Mere juxtaposition of the two areas of study, perhaps emphasising one content area at the expense of another</li> <li>• A limited attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• Insufficient use of accurate evidence and examples</li> <li>• Immature style of writing</li> <li>• Lacking in structure and coherence.</li> </ul>	<b>7–12</b>
<p><b>Band 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A basic understanding of the connections between the selected areas of study in relation to the theme</li> <li>• Demonstrating only partially accurate knowledge of the different content areas studied</li> <li>• Little attempt, if any, at critical analysis</li> <li>• Inappropriate style of writing with a very basic structure.</li> </ul>	<b>0–6</b>

## AO2 (20 marks)

<p><b>Band 5</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A comprehensive analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• Very effective comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints</li> <li>• Mature personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A very well sustained and critical argument, expressed accurately and fluently with considerable sophistication using a wide range of terminology.</li> </ul>	<b>17–20</b>
<p><b>Band 4</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A good analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• Very good comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints</li> <li>• Good personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A well sustained and critical argument, expressed accurately, fluently and using a range of terminology.</li> </ul>	<b>13–16</b>
<p><b>Band 3</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A reasonable analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• Very good comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints</li> <li>• Some evidence of personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A line of argument, expressed accurately and using some relevant terminology.</li> </ul>	<b>9–12</b>
<p><b>Band 2</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• Some comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints</li> <li>• Limited personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• Little evidence of critical argument</li> <li>• Inaccuracies evident.</li> </ul>	<b>5–8</b>
<p><b>Band 1</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A basic analysis of the statement in relation to connections made between the areas of study and other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• Little, if any, comparison and evaluation of scholarly viewpoints</li> <li>• Minimal personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A basic attempt to follow a line of argument</li> <li>• Imprecisely expressed.</li> </ul>	<b>0–4</b>

## Section B

## Synoptic Assessment

## Theme: Holiness

You **must** answer this question

- 5 (a) An outline and examination of the contribution of some key people to the nature and importance of holiness could include, e.g.:
- consideration of the contribution of relevant key figures in relation to at least two areas of study
  - interpretation of the nature and importance of holiness as a perfection of God in both areas of study, holiness as a virtue
  - references to the call to holiness, conversion to holiness, nature of holiness, women and holiness, challenges of holiness, forgiveness as related to holiness
  - contributions to the style and type of holiness displayed
  - consideration of the obstacles encountered
  - handling of the challenges posed by holiness
  - impact on lifestyles and decisions
  - differing responses to the nature of holiness
  - rigours of maintaining holiness causing different form of sacrifice
  - awareness of sense of obedience to the law, leadership
  - opposition and rejection of society towards the nature of holiness [30]
- (b) A critical assessment of the view that suffering is necessary for growth in holiness may include, e.g.:
- an open-ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples with reference to other aspects of human experience
  - possible reference to scriptural examples of individual/collective holiness
  - examples of the conflict between secular world and holiness
  - elements of suffering may transform and change the person as a striving for perfection
  - until hardship arrives there is no experience of the extent of relationship with fellow humans or God
  - faith needs to be tested for endurance
  - suffering tests the human capabilities and potentials
  - chief purpose of suffering is to be Christlike
  - Jesus tried to avoid suffering unless in obedience to his Father
  - the response to suffering is the priority
  - suffering as Allah's will [20]

Section B

50

Total

150

AVAILABLE  
MARKS