



ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2017

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit AS 7

assessing

**Foundations of Ethics with Special Reference to
Issues in Medical Ethics**

[SRE71]

WEDNESDAY 31 MAY, AFTERNOON

MARK SCHEME

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement.

The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must refer to different units of study in their AO1 response to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question.

1 (a) "The Decalogue is morally binding on Christians." With reference to this statement, explain the importance of the Decalogue in addressing issues in medical ethics.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to the statement.
- The Commandments as a fundamental charter of human rights – statements of the rights of God and/or the person.
- How love of God and of neighbour can help the Christian to live a morally virtuous life.
- The Decalogue as revealing the core moral principles for Christians in the arena of medical ethics, e.g. love God, honour parents, respect life.
- How the Decalogue reinforces the importance of truthfulness, honesty and sincerity.
- How particular Commandments are relevant to certain scenarios, e.g. 'Thou shall not kill' in relation to abortion, euthanasia, I.V.F.; the relevance of the Commandment 'Honour your father and mother' to issues relating to care of the elderly.
- How the Decalogue reinforces the principle of the Sacredness of Human Life.
- How the Commandments reveal an eternal dimension for the Christian in moral decision making.
- The community dimension of religious morality.
- The Commandments as stipulating a set of moral imperatives, of Divine Commands.
- The apodictic character of the Commandments – terse, clear and emphatic.
- The Decalogue as fundamental to Christian morality, how God's role is absolute.
- How the Christian is called to live a morally virtuous life guided by the Decalogue.
- How for Christians the teaching and example of Jesus is also of great importance.
- The relationship between law and love.
- The Decalogue is morally binding even on issues outside medical ethics.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) Comment on the view that Natural Moral Law provides the best approach for guidance on ethical dilemmas. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Natural Moral Law (NML) as providing clear guidance and certainty on rules that cannot be compromised.
- How the act is either intrinsically morally right or wrong.
- NML as a duty based approach.
- How the theory can be applied universally by all people, whether religious or not.
- How the Bible does not deal with specific contemporary issues, e.g. PGD.
- The use of NML in Roman Catholicism to provide clear direction on ongoing moral dilemmas.
- The use of primary and secondary precepts in addressing moral issues.
- How NML need not be inflexible, e.g. the tradition of Proportionalism.
- The difficulty in determining what is natural.
- How some are of the view that human reason has been tainted by the Fall and therefore cannot be trusted.
- How the theory is seen as too rigid and legalistic.
- How the theory is fundamentally based on a view that the world has been designed by a rational and purposeful creator and how this is challenged.
- What happens when specific religious moral injunctions conflict with the general principles given by NML.
- The role of unconscious promptings.
- The accusation of the Naturalistic Fallacy.
- How the application of the Primary and Secondary Precepts could lead to remote precepts, e.g. subjugation of women.
- The merits of other ethical approaches, e.g. Utilitarianism, Situation Ethics.
- The Bible as providing guidelines/principles for any moral dilemma.
- Contemporary views on the merits of NML, e.g. John Finnis, Christine Gudorf.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

2 (a) With particular reference to the nature of love, discuss the approach of Situation Ethics to moral decision making.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Situation Ethics as a teleological approach to moral decision making.
- Its emergence in the 1960s in the work of Joseph Fletcher.
- Fletcher's rejection of legalistic and antinomian approaches, Situation Ethics as a simpler and less complicated alternative to legalism.
- The development of a middle way in which the only absolute is the command to love your neighbour as yourself.
- The contextual and situational character of morality.
- Fletcher's working principles – Pragmatism, Relativism, Positivism, Personalism.
- His fundamental principles.
- The importance of the primacy of love – agapeistic love as the ruling norm, unconditional selfless love.
- Possible comparison with other types of love.
- How the ruling norm of moral decision making is love, nothing else.
- Emulating the example of Jesus in love of God and love of neighbour.
- The influence of Paul's teaching, especially that on love in 1 Corinthians 13
- How love's decisions are made situationally, not prescriptively.
- Reference to case studies used by Fletcher to illustrate the application of the love principle, e.g. that of Mrs Bergmeier or other scenarios, e.g. in medical ethics.
- The appeal of Situation Ethics to liberal Christians.
- How this approach can provide guidance for Christians on moral issues not dealt with in the Bible.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) Assess the claim that teleological ethics are dangerous and unchristian.
Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Possible reference to teleological approaches such as Utilitarianism and Situation Ethics.
- How typically in consequentialist theories, the end could justify the means.
- The apparent abandonment of moral absolutes, how any action need not be intrinsically right or wrong.
- The emergence of Utilitarianism as 'the ethics of the planet', its secular appeal, how religious based ethics is seen as belonging to a bygone age.
- How Utilitarianism could sanction horrific acts in pursuit of the application of the utility principle.
- Fyodor Dostoyevsky's criticism of Utilitarianism.
- How Situation Ethics appears to be a form of Utilitarianism.
- How Situation Ethics is seen by some to compromise justice, how it could possibly approve of mercy killing or adultery.
- How Situation Ethics, while it rejects antinomianism could itself be guilty of antinomianism.
- The continued relevance for the retention of clear moral absolutes as seen in biblical ethics.
- The alternative of Natural Moral Law which is deontological in character.
- How some Christians can embrace Utilitarianism.
- Situation Ethics as a theological ethic.
- How teleological approaches can have an absolutist character and not encouraging moral confusion and possible anarchy.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

Section A

50

Section B**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question.

3 (a) Explain how the acts/omissions doctrine is central to the debate on Euthanasia.

Answers may include:

- Clarification of the acts/omissions doctrine, as to how there is a difference between doing something and not doing something even if there is the same outcome.
- How this is relevant in the euthanasia debate in establishing the distinction between passive and active euthanasia.
- How passive euthanasia is tolerated by many but not active euthanasia.
- How the doctrine is rooted in Natural Moral Law.
- Different views on the legitimacy of the doctrine, e.g. James Rachels, who is highly critical of the doctrine and the distinction it makes.
- How for some there is no logical difference between an act and an omission and hence, no moral difference.
- The right to freedom from unnecessary pain and suffering – the quality of life argument.
- Respect for the autonomy of the dying person.
- The right to a dignified death, a moral way to die.
- The principle, freedom to live/freedom to die.
- The sovereignty of the individual.
- The view of the sacredness of human life.
- God as the author of life.
- The body as the temple of the Holy Spirit.
- The relevance of the Commandment – Thou shall not kill.
- The Christian view of suffering and death, the spiritual value of suffering.
- The slippery slope argument, dangers of misuse.
- Widespread acceptance of the acts/omissions doctrine.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) “An ethical system without absolutes is not ethics at all.” With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the truth of this claim. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the statement in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary examples.
- The challenges presented by ethical relativism, by moral nihilism.
- Problems presented by subjectivist approaches to ethics.
- The influence of secular views – how religious morality and hence Divine Commands can be seen as outdated.
- The view that there are no fixed moral truths.
- The ambiguous nature of ethics (Simone de Beauvoir).
- The individual as the supreme moral agent.
- The value of moral absolutes as offering certainty, of offering a universal guide on moral issues.
- How moral absolutes are not necessarily inflexible.
- How the end cannot justify the means.
- Possible reference to particular views, e.g. Nietzsche, Sartre.
- Possible reference to other ethical systems, e.g. Kantian Ethics, Virtue Ethics, Narrative Ethics.
- The need to combat ‘the dictatorship of moral relativism’.
- Christians who could identify with a contextual/relativistic approach to ethics.
- The importance of compassion and love in moral decision making.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

4 (a) In what ways do different views on the status of the embryo inform developments in bioethics?

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Different views on the status of the embryo, e.g. the embryo as a person in its own right or as a potential person as against the embryo having no moral status at all – the foetus is ‘nothing paradigm’.
- The principle of the Sacredness of Human Life.
- How this principle can inform the issue of personhood, e.g. in Roman Catholic teaching, personhood is conferred from the moment of conception.
- How in this view the integrity of the embryo has to be protected and so, not violated – thus, implications for the practice of abortion, developments in bioethics such as I.V.F., embryo experimentation.
- How if the status of the embryo is impugned then developments in bioethics are pursued.
- The influence of the Utilitarian Ethic.
- The role of science and how it can assist human reproduction.
- The demise of religious teaching/values.
- Developments in bioethics as a humanitarian and compassionate response to human need.
- The importance of human progress, the elimination of disease and imperfection.
- Technological progress as assisting/respecting the moral imperatives of human life and dignity.
- The danger of reducing the status of the embryo to an object of scientific interest.
- The need to counteract the commodification of life and consumerist type choices.
- The perspective of Natural Moral Law.
- Different Christian views.
- Possible reference to particular developments in bioethics, e.g. I.V.F., P.G.D., I.C.S.I.
- Possible reference to the Warnock Report and the HFEA.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess the view that new reproductive technologies undermine the equal dignity of individuals. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the statement in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary examples.
- Progress that is being made in relation to new reproductive technologies, e.g. stem cell therapy.
- The need for human progress.
- Overcoming human imperfection and the blight of infertility.
- Implications of such developments for the integrity of the embryo, the newborn.
- How the embryo is being extracted out of the context and nexus of human relationships.
- How the embryo is being used to benefit others, even if this requires its destruction.
- The inviolability of the embryo, the call to care for the weakest in society.
- Implications of such developments for marriage and family, for donors.
- The emergence of the 'designer child' and issues here.
- The possible functional and instrumental character of such developments, e.g. saviour siblings, cloning.
- The possibility of new classes of people – genetically enhanced against genetically unenhanced.
- The impact of China's One Child Policy.
- Gender related issues – the status of the female foetus.
- Possible racial overtones, e.g. black eugenics.
- The concept of evolutionary biology.
- How various world faiths see new reproductive technologies, e.g. Islam

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2) [25] 50

Section B

50

Total

100