



ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2018

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit AS 5

assessing

The Celtic Church in Ireland in the 5th, 6th and 7th Centuries

[SRE51]

WEDNESDAY 23 MAY, MORNING

MARK SCHEME

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must refer to different units of study in their AO1 response to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

| Band | AO1 Performance Descriptors | Marks |
|------|---|-----------|
| 5 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [21]–[25] |
| 4 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [16]–[20] |
| 3 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [11]–[15] |
| 2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [6]–[10] |
| 1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [0]–[5] |

| Band | AO2 Performance Descriptors | Marks |
|------|---|-----------|
| 5 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [21]–[25] |
| 4 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [16]–[20] |
| 3 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [11]–[15] |
| 2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [6]–[10] |

| Band | AO2 Performance Descriptors | Marks |
|------|--|---------|
| 1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar | [0]–[5] |

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A**AVAILABLE MARKS**Answer **one** question.**1 (a)** "Britain's influence was central to the origins of Irish monasticism"

With reference to this statement, discuss the origins of monasticism in Ireland.

Answers may include:

- the influence of Ninnian's monastery of Candida Casa
- influence of Wales
- awareness of the possible impact of Gildas, Samson, Cadoc and David
- importance of the monastic founders who trained in monasteries in Britain, e.g. Enda of Aran, Finnian of Clonard and Brendan of Clonfert
- the influence of Patrick
- importance of Ligugé, Marseilles, Lérins
- reference to earlier influences, e.g. Desert Fathers
- reference to the development of monasticism in the East and impact on Ireland
- the degree to which different styles of monasticism adopted by Irish monastic founders may have been influenced by their training, e.g. focus on asceticism, importance of study
- possible reference to such scholars as Chadwick, Hanson and Ryan

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) Assess the claim that the importance of the monasteries in the Celtic Church and society has been greatly exaggerated. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- the monasteries were certainly prominent and important, though the Celtic Church was originally episcopal in character
- the importance and role of Bishops in the early Celtic Church
- economic strength of the monasteries
- provision of education in the monasteries
- role of the scriptorium in the production of books of religious and cultural importance
- monasteries offered a sense of community in the absence of towns
- many families remained outside the monasteries
- positive influence of the monasteries in terms of hospitality
- awareness of monastic support for the Penitential system and provision of soul friends
- continued influence of paganism in Irish society
- a small number of people required sanctuary in the monasteries
- monasteries controlled the writings of the period and were not therefore going to minimise their own importance
- relevant views of scholars such as Hughes, Kenney and Ryan

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

2 (a) Examine the features of the Celtic Penitentials with particular reference to the **Penitentials of Finnian and Columbanus**.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- background to the Penitentials
- confession of sins of thought
- curing of contraries by contraries
- private and repeatable penance
- grading of penances according to the status of the sinner and nature of the sin
- idea of Anamchara or soul friend
- nature and variety of penances outlined, e.g. fasting, alms-giving
- commutation to shorten the duration or change the type of penance
- compensation to those injured
- reference to the Penitential of Finnian as the earliest comprehensive Irish Penitential, e.g. structure of Finnian as 53 canons in length
- the structure of the Penitential of Columbanus with separate sections for monks, clerics and laity
- use of relevant textual references from the Penitentials of Columbanus and Finnian to explore various features
- possible reference to such scholars as Connolly and McNeill

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) Comment on the view that the Penitentials played a negative role in addressing the issue of sexual behaviour. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- the argument that the focus on sexual matters in such detail did little to support a healthy view of human sexuality
- the need for sexual moral norms at that time due to the barbaric nature of Celtic society
- the focus in the Penitentials on sexual sin and other related issues, e.g. inappropriate sexual desires, adultery, fornication, abstinence within marriage
- the view that the focus on sexual sin in the Penitentials betrays the authors' concern with this issue as opposed to reflecting the sexual immorality of society at that time
- the role the Penitentials played in challenging unacceptable sexual practices present in society at that time
- from a modern point of view the nature of the focus and possible obsession on sexual immorality and sexual behaviour in the Penitentials of Finnian, Cummean and Columbanus
- the importance of the Penitentials as a guide to lay persons as to what Christian sexual morality entailed
- the role and importance of the Penitentials in supporting reconciliation with God
- the role of the Penitentials as a guide for confessors supporting penitents who confess sexual sin
- views of scholars such as Brundage, Plummer, Connolly and K. Hughes

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

Section B**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question.

3 (a) Examine the themes of denunciation and repentance in Patrick's **Letter to Coroticus**.

Answers may include:

- reference to the denunciation of Coroticus and his actions
- Patrick's call for Coroticus and his men to repent
- Patrick's identification of the importance of forgiveness from his own life experience
- exploration of the excommunication of Coroticus and his fellow attackers
- Patrick's call for penance to be completed by the perpetrators including actions such as freeing those captured
- comparison of the actions of the Christians of Gaul with the lack of action from the Christians of Britain in relation to Christian converts sold into slavery
- reference to sin of avarice
- the Letter's appeal to the British clergy in relation to their response to the actions of Coroticus
- call to the whole Church in Britain to identify with the victims of Coroticus and isolate the perpetrators
- the emphasis on Christian unity and Patrick's outline of a common Christian identity, shared by all baptised people, regardless of race
- appropriate textual references from the Letter to Coroticus to illustrate the themes of denunciation and repentance
- awareness of other related themes
- views of scholars such as De Paor, Duffy and Conneely

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) "Faith and prayer are vital for people in times of trouble"
 With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess this claim.
 Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience
- an open ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples
- reference to scripture on the importance of faith and prayer
- the importance of prayer in the life of Jesus
- exploration of the link between faith and prayer for those experiencing times of trouble
- importance of religious ceremony as a focus for faith and prayer in times of trouble, e.g. funeral services
- the view that praying for others who are experiencing difficulties is a valuable exercise
- the debate in relation to the work of contemplative religious orders and the value of their work praying for others in times of trouble
- the argument that faith and prayer offer a false sense of hope to those in challenging situations
- the view that only practical help and assistance support those experiencing problems
- critical exploration of the role of faith and prayer in relation to miracles and places associated with such events, e.g. Lourdes
- examples of well-known individuals who credit faith and prayer with helping them through difficult times
- reference to the value of other religious practices in times of trouble, e.g. alms giving
- the role of faith and prayer in offering support to believers in other world religions
- the importance of faith and prayer in world religions

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

4 (a) In what ways does Cogitosus' **Life of Brigit** raise questions about the reliability of Celtic hagiography?

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- a definition and awareness of the nature of hagiographical writing
- awareness of the background and purpose of Cogitosus' Life of Brigit
- an exploration of the miraculous events in the Life of Brigit and questions over their reliability
- the reliability of the incidental information provided in the Life of Brigit regarding the political, social and religious aspects of society
- information and insights available concerning church politics during the period when the Life of Brigit was written
- awareness of various stories concerning the actions of Brigit and the historical reliability of such events
- the reliability of information in the Life of Brigit describing the layout and decoration of the church at Kildare
- the limited nature of sources available to Cogitosus when writing the Life of Brigit and distance from the events he describes
- the influence of stories about the pagan goddess Brigit and the reliability of the portrayal of the historical Brigit in the text
- use of relevant textual references from the Life of Brigit
- views of scholars such as De Paor and Ó Crónín

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the view that personal integrity is not critical for the religious life. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience
- an open ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples
- the argument that a sense of vocation and calling are the most critical aspects for the religious life
- the view that the motivation of those entering religious life is most critical, e.g. to live a life dedicated to the needs of others, to lead a life of prayer
- contemporary and/or historical examples of people in religious life who demonstrate the importance and centrality of a high degree of personal integrity
- examination of the connection between the vows taken in religious life and the demands they make on the personal integrity of a person
- reference to religious orders or religious communities and the importance they place on personal integrity in religious life
- examination of the temptations that those in religious life face leading to issues with personal integrity, e.g. sexual relationships, desire for material goods
- the role of the Holy Spirit and prayer in helping those in religious life overcome issues relating to personal integrity
- examples of people in religious life who have failed to live up to their calling due to a lack of personal integrity
- some examples from recent times in Ireland give the lie to the importance of personal integrity, e.g. the Ferns report
- those who are religious are like everyone else and have emotions and temptations that lead to destruction and an absence of personal integrity, e.g. jealousy, various types of temptation like power, money or materialism
- the argument that some people do not equate the religious life with personal integrity in the religious life

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

Total

100