



ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2018

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit AS 7

assessing

**Foundations of Ethics with Special Reference to
Issues in Medical Ethics**

[SRE71]

FRIDAY 25 MAY, MORNING

MARK SCHEME

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must refer to different units of study in their AO1 response to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question.

- 1 (a) "Morality is best served by pursuing happiness." Examine this statement with particular reference to the views of Jeremy Bentham and J.S. Mill.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to the statement
- The utilitarian maxim "the greatest happiness of the greatest number" (the utility principle)
- The ideas of Bentham
 - society as a collection of individuals and what is right for society depends on securing the happiness of people
 - the democratic principle, each person to count equally with everyone having an equal right to happiness
 - the devising of the Hedonic Calculus and its use with possible exemplification
 - thus, the idea of quantitative happiness
 - Bentham's primary interest in the benefits generated and how they were shared
 - the development of act utilitarianism
- The ideas of Mill
 - the importance of qualitative as against quantitative happiness
 - the importance of 'higher pleasures'
 - how for Mill, Jesus' command to love your neighbour as yourself constitutes 'the ideal perfection of utilitarian morality'
 - the development of rule utilitarianism with possible exemplification
- How the ideas of Bentham and Mill were influenced by the social conditions of the time
- the development of Preference Utilitarianism and how it gets around the problem of using the utilitarian ethic to impose one idea of happiness on someone who may have a different one
- Utilitarianism as having its roots in Epicureanism and Hedonism
- Utilitarianism as a teleological approach to moral decision making
- the appeal of the utilitarian ethic in an increasingly secular and godless age
- how the utilitarian ethic is currently driving decisions in medical ethics and sexual morality

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) Explore the view that medical ethics should only be guided by the Quality of Life principle. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Clarification of the Quality of Life principle which appears to take an instrumentalist view of human life
- How the Quality of Life argument appears to be assuming greater prominence in modern medical ethics
- The advocacy of this principle by contemporary moral philosophers, e.g. Peter Singer
- The apparent impugning of the Sanctity of Life principle by some philosophers such as Singer
- Singer's five rational Quality of Life commandments, e.g. recognise that the worth of human life varies, respect a person's desire to live or die
- The influence of the utilitarian ethic and how it appears to offer a rational means by which to judge the quality of an individual's life
- Possible reference to scenarios in medical ethics, e.g. euthanasia
- How the utilitarian ethic could dehumanise the intrinsic value of human life
- How in utilitarianism there are different understandings of what is meant by Quality of Life
- How this principle is too subjective, e.g. who decides what constitutes a worthwhile life?
- The erosion of personal integrity (the views of Bernard Williams)
- How for religious people life is God-given and should be treated with the utmost dignity and be protected
- The influence of Natural Moral Law, e.g. how innocent life should always be protected
- How life and death issues are then viewed, e.g. abortion, euthanasia
- How the Sanctity of Life principle protects the inviolability of human life
- Views on personhood and ensoulment
- How for some, life is not to be preserved at all costs but treated with dignity (the weak Sanctity of Life principle)
- Possible reference to the Liverpool Care Pathway for the Dying Patient

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

2 (a) Examine the religious and ethical problems presented by embryo research.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- The use of embryo research to enhance the quality of life argument, e.g. to eliminate causes of infertility, to enable the detection of genetic abnormalities, the elimination of diseases, e.g. Parkinson's
- The status of the embryo – the personhood debate
- The Sanctity of Life principle v. the Quality of Life principle
- Religious views, e.g. God as the author of human life, all human life as 'imago dei', how innocent human life needs to be protected, how human life has intrinsic value, the embryo as having an inherent right to life, the embryo as having an interest in not being harmed
- Reference to specific Church teaching, e.g. Roman Catholic and how such research is fundamentally morally wrong (the application of Natural Moral Law – protect and preserve the innocent)
- Non-religious views, e.g. the sentience position (human personhood develops according to the degree of consciousness), the difficulty in determining the difference between pre-embryo status and embryo status (held as 14 days), how there is no automatic right to life, the impugning of the Sanctity of Life principle, the influence of the utilitarian ethic and the desire for human betterment
- The views of more liberal Christians – how there is no consensus as to the ontological status of the early embryo, the influence of Situation Ethics and how the principle of love could possibly justify the use of the embryo, the desire to act in the best interests of society, how such need not necessarily lead to antinomianism
- Alternatives to embryo research

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) Assess the claim that developments in reproductive technology should not be hindered by traditional religious and ethical standards. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Developments in reproductive technology as improving the lot of humankind, e.g. overcoming the plight of human infertility
- Possible reference to particular developments, e.g. IVF, ICSI, PGD
- How science can be used to assist human reproduction, the view of science as a gift from God to aid human betterment
- The importance of human freedom especially reproductive freedom
- The post-modern age and the declining influence of religious teaching
- The impact of the utilitarian ethic
- The right to have a child, to experience parenthood and family
- How developments in reproductive technology are controlled, e.g. the role of the HFEA
- How such developments contravene cherished religious and ethical standards, e.g. God as the author of life, the one flesh principle, the procreative and unitive nature of the sexual act
- How for some Christians such developments can undermine the status of the embryo, marriage (e.g. mechanical adultery) and family
- How such developments can lead to the commodification of life; the need to counteract consumer type choices
- How secular groups such as Human Genetics Alert are concerned, e.g. have spoken out against Three Parent Embryos arguing that it crosses a line and could lead to the risk of a 'consumer eugenic market'
- The unhealthy obsession with becoming pregnant, a child as a privilege and not a right
- Childlessness as the will of God
- How while the Bible may not say anything directly about reproductive technologies, it still provides certain principles
- The importance of love and compassion

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

Section B**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question.

- 3 (a)** In what ways can the Sermon on the Mount provide guidance for the Christian with regard to morality?

Answers may include:

- How the Sermon offers principles that can guide moral decision making, principles that are unchangeable, e.g. the call to perfection, the importance of the proper internal moral disposition, imitating the example of Jesus, the rejection of hypocrisy, show mercy, purity of heart, seek justice, discernment in judgement, the love ethic
- The values encouraged by the Sermon, e.g. dependence on God, spirit of gentleness, being merciful, love of enemy
- The virtues promoted by the Sermon, e.g. sincerity, mercy, love
- The teaching covered, e.g. the portrait of the Christian disciple, murder, adultery, divorce, revenge, attitudes to religious duties, attitudes to materialism, judgement
- The essence of Christian discipleship in love of God and of neighbour
- The eschatological nature of morality that is revealed
- The Sermon as a blueprint for Christian ethics, society and all morality
- The context of the Sermon as a redefining of Old Testament law
- Exemplification from the Sermon

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the view that biblical ethics continues to be relevant for moral decision making. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the view in relation to other aspects of human experience
- An open ended response citing relevant historical and/or contemporary examples
- How biblical teaching can provide principles/guidance for moral dilemmas, even those not mentioned in scripture, e.g. sanctity of human life, human dignity, the Commandments, the love command, the call for the proper internal moral disposition
- How the Bible does cover issues that have an ageless significance, e.g. stealing, murder, adultery, divorce, retaliation, sexual immorality, care of the stranger, care of the marginalised
- Possible reference to Paul's ethical teaching
- Biblical teaching as revealing profound truths about the human condition
- The eternal and eschatological character of moral decision making for the religious believer
- How the Bible does not appear to cover issues prominent in the current age, e.g. new reproductive technologies
- How biblical ethics are seen by some to be outdated, e.g. Peter Singer, Richard Dawkins
- The views of Alain de Botton
- Problems surrounding interpretation of biblical teaching
- The standard of biblical ethics may be seen as too high, aspirational only
- The role played by church teaching

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access

Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

4 (a) Explain how the doctrine of double effect is relevant to the issue of abortion.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- Clarification of the doctrine of double effect – while it may be morally permissible to perform a good action that may have a bad outcome, it is morally impermissible to perform a bad action with a good outcome
- The development of this doctrine by Aquinas and therefore rooted in the traditions of Natural Moral Law
- How this doctrine allows for some flexibility in the application of Natural Moral Law theory (which is a duty based approach)
- Exemplification of the doctrine at work in relation to abortion in cases where the mother's life may be threatened by an ectopic pregnancy or uterine cancer
- How in these cases the outcome of indirect therapeutic abortion may be morally permissible but not direct therapeutic abortion
- The acceptance of this doctrine within Roman Catholic moral teaching, though technically it does not permit abortion
- How in the application of the doctrine the quality of intention is important
- How in the case of indirect therapeutic abortion, the intention is not to kill rather the death of the unborn could be a by-product of the intervention to save the lives of the mother and child (evil is not intended from the outset)
- How some Christians reject the rigid deontological legalism seen as characteristic of this approach
- How some Christians are prepared to accept the direct act of abortion in extreme cases such as where the mother's life is at risk
- How for some abortion is entirely a woman's choice, possibly in any circumstance
- How consequentialists view the doctrine

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

- (b) "The sovereignty of the individual is all that matters in ethics." With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess the truth of this claim. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience
- An open-ended response citing relevant historical and/or contemporary examples
- The advocacy of this principle by J.S. Mill – how individuals are free to pursue what gives them pleasure but they are not entitled to do that which could harm others
- How the principle reinforces the importance of personal autonomy and freedom
- The sovereign individual as one who believes in rights and power for the individual
- How if society leaves individuals free to live in a way that makes them happy, this could in turn benefit wider society
- How the principle assumes that people **do** make rational and sensible choices
- The role of the unconscious in moral decision making
- The importance of moral responsibility
- Difficulties surrounding the notion of asserting absolute rights
- The importance of the community ethic
- The authority of scripture in Christian ethics
- The dangers of moral relativism
- The Islamic perspective – submission to the will of Allah
- How there may be distrust of the state and/or religion
- Possible exemplification using examples from sexual ethics, suicide, organ transplantation, self-mutilation
- The relationship between private morality and public morality

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2) [25] 50

Total 100