



**ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)**  
**General Certificate of Education**  
**2019**

---

## **Religious Studies**

**Assessment Unit AS 8**

*assessing*

**An Introduction to the Philosophy of Religion**

**[SRE81]**

**FRIDAY 31 MAY, MORNING**

---

## **MARK SCHEME**

## General Marking Instructions

### ***Introduction***

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

### ***Assessment objectives***

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
  - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
  - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
  - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
  - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

### ***Quality of candidates' responses***

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

### ***Flexibility in marking***

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

### ***Positive marking***

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

### ***Awarding zero marks***

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

### **Levels of response**

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

### **Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level**

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

### **Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level**

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

### **Quality of written communication**

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

**Level 1 (Basic):** The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

**Level 2 (Limited):** The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

**Level 3 (Good):** The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

**Level 4 (Very Good):** The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

**Level 5 (Excellent):** The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An excellent response to the question asked</li> <li>• Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge</li> <li>• Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies</li> <li>• A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A very good response to the question asked</li> <li>• Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge</li> <li>• Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies</li> <li>• A very good range of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A good response to the question asked</li> <li>• Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge</li> <li>• Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies</li> <li>• A good range of relevant evidence and examples</li> <li>• A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence</li> <li>• A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited response to the question asked</li> <li>• Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding</li> <li>• Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies</li> <li>• A limited range of evidence and/or examples</li> <li>• A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence</li> <li>• A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[6]–[10]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A basic response to the question asked</li> <li>• Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding</li> <li>• Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies</li> <li>• Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples</li> <li>• A basic answer with basic structure and coherence</li> <li>• A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[0]–[5]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked</li> <li>• An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked</li> <li>• A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure</li> <li>• A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked</li> <li>• A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence</li> <li>• A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked</li> <li>• A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence</li> <li>• A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[6]–[10]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis</li> <li>• A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked</li> <li>• A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience</li> <li>• A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought</li> <li>• A basic answer with basic structure and coherence</li> <li>• A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar</li> </ul>	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

**Section A****AVAILABLE  
MARKS**Answer **one** question from Section A.

1 (a) 'The Cosmological Argument, has had a number of reformulations.' With particular reference to this statement, examine the Cosmological Argument.

Answers may include:

- Reference to the quotation provided.
- An outlining of the development of the Cosmological Argument from its roots in Greek philosophy to modern interpretations of the argument.
- A brief outlining of the main features of the Cosmological Argument.
- An exploration of Aquinas' Three Ways.
- Reference to its roots in the work of Plato and Aristotle.
- A discussion of Aquinas' development of the Cosmological Argument in *Summa Theologica*.
- Reference to the Kalam argument and the contribution of Craig.
- An exploration of the development of the argument by scholars such as Copleston, Leibniz and Morrison.
- Reference to the Copleston–Russell debate.
- An exploration of the term reformulation.
- Development of the issue of causality – Elizabeth Anscombe.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) To what extent has this argument been successful? Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

Answers may include:

- An exploration of the strengths and weaknesses of this argument.
- Challenges and criticisms of this argument by scholars such as Russell, Kant and Hume.
- An exploration as to whether any 'proofs' are acceptable in an increasing atheistic and secular world.
- The challenge of modern science to the argument – whether infinite regression can be ruled out, whether there is a need for a Divine source to the universe/Prime Mover.
- Support for the Cosmological argument as offering a logical and a posteriori argument for God's existence.
- Reference to scientific support for the concept of a First Cause.
- An exploration as to whether the Big Bang and/or Chaos theory supports or challenges the Cosmological argument.
- Reference to the views of theistic and atheistic scholars such as Dawkins, Hitchens, Swinburne and Plantinga.
- Comparison between inductive and deductive statements and the nature of proofs for God's existence.
- Comparison between various Classical proofs, as being more or less successful.
- A distinction between theistic and atheistic reactions to the Cosmological argument.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

2 (a) Examine the main features of Teresa of Avila's writings concerning religious experience.

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

Answers may include:

- An exploration of Teresa's writings concerning religious experience, the four stages of the ascent of the soul and the seven mansions.
- Reference to selected writings of Teresa of Avila including her Autobiography, The Way of Perfection and The Interior Castle.
- An exploration of Teresa's record of visions such as her encounter with the Divine, her vision of Christ, her vision of hell and the ecstasy.
- An exploration of the contribution of Teresa of Avila to an understanding of the nature of religious experiences, her acknowledgement as a 'Doctor of the Church'.
- Possible link to other mystics in the church who have shared similar experiences.
- A discussion of Teresa's importance as a mystic and her contribution to mysticism.
- An exploration of Teresa's analogies – the watered garden, the interior castle.
- Reference to Teresa's role as a reformer.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) "Religious claims based solely on personal and subjective experience are unlikely to be true." With reference to this claim, evaluate the view that religious experience points to the existence of the Divine. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

Answers may include:

- An exploration of the claim, the nature of what constitutes truth.
- Reference to empiricism's focus on sense experience as a means of verifying what is true.
- Religious experience as a means by which believers encounter the Divine.
- An exploration of the features of God as revealed through religious experience, an interventionist and personal Deity.
- An exploration of the veracity and value of such experiences.
- Reference to the writings of Otto and William James concerning the nature and function of religious experiences.
- Possible reference to examples from sacred texts in support of the veracity of religious experience, e.g. Paul's conversion.
- Challenges to the existence of a Deity and thus, of any form of religious experience.
- A critique of religious experiences by psychologists such as Freud, religious experiences being a form of delusion and/or hysteria.
- Challenges to the veracity of selected religious experiences – miracles, visions and/or conversions.
- Possible discussion as to whether such experiences simply reveal an arbitrary and capricious God.
- Whether the Divine is best revealed through other means, e.g. through creation, sacred texts.
- The views of theistic and atheistic scholars to this debate – Bacon, Atkins, Dawkins, Kierkegaard, Jung and Swinburne.
- Religious experiences as differing within faith traditions.
- An exploration of the authenticity of all human experiences.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

**Section B****AVAILABLE  
MARKS**Answer **one** question from Section B.

3 (a) 'In the Bible, miracles are viewed as acts of Divine intervention in human affairs.' With particular reference to this quotation, discuss the Christian view of miracles.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to the quotation.
- A definition of the term miracle, as being a suspension of the laws of nature/an extraordinary event and as having deeper symbolic importance/religious significance.
- An exploration of Christian teaching concerning the significance, nature and purpose of miracle.
- An exploration of the centrality of miracles recorded within the Bible including the Exodus, the Incarnation and Resurrection.
- An analysis of miracle types as recorded in the Bible, healing, exorcism, resurrection and nature miracles; how miracle is understood by the Evangelists.
- Christian belief in and reliance on the miracle accounts recorded in the Bible.
- A discussion of Aquinas' classification of and citing of Biblical miracles.
- Reference to the views of selected Christian scholars on miracles such as Paley, CS Lewis, Swinburne, Wiles, Bultmann.
- A discussion of the importance to miracles for Christians.
- An acknowledgment that miracles are recorded in a variety of other sources including sacred texts.
- An exploration of theistic definitions of the term miracle.
- An exploration of realist/anti realist views concerning miracles

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess the view that miraculous claims should always be treated with suspicion. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- An open ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples.
- A discussion of the validity of miraculous claims.
- Atheism's rejection of any form of Divine intervention, perceived 'miracles' as being mere wish fulfilment.
- Reference to Bultman's call to demythologise the Bible, miracles as an obstacle to faith.
- An exploration of the God of the gaps concept – medicine, science and technology as closing gaps in human knowledge and the subsequent decreasing need for Divine intervention.
- The views of contemporary thinkers on miracles such as Dawkins, Derren Brown, Gibson, Keener, James Clarke.
- An exploration of false or fraudulent miraculous claims and the motivation behind such claims.
- Support for the existence of miracles today – the Vatican Commission on miracle, examples of faith healing.
- The function and value of miracles today as confirming Divine benevolence and as offering hope to humanity, e.g. stigmata.
- Reference to Swinburne's argument concerning testimony.
- An analysis of the veracity of selected claimed miracles.
- Reference to the Rationalist view, alternative explanations to cited miracle.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

4 (a) Explain the relevance of the Free Will defence argument to the problem of evil.

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

Answers may include:

- A brief outlining of the Free Will defence and the primacy of human freedom in the face of evil and suffering.
- A discussion of the nature of God and the purpose of evil and suffering.
- Reference to the writings of selected scholars to this defence, e.g. Swinburne, Hick, Plantinga, Lennox.
- An exploration of the concept of epistemic distance and the counterfactual argument.
- An exploration of the roots of the Free Will defence in the theodicies of Augustine and/or Irenaeus.
- Reference to allied analogies such as Vardy's peasant girl analogy.
- An exploration of the strengths of the Free Will defence in responding to the problem of evil, Free Will as enabling spiritual growth.
- Brief reference to the problem of evil and the Inconsistent Triad.
- Reference to DZ Phillips' rejection of the Free Will defence, a God who allows suffering is not worthy of worship.
- Relevant Biblical references – the Creation and Fall Narratives.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, comment on the claim that the existence of evil reveals a God who is either evil or non-existent. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE  
MARKS

Answers may include:

- An open ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples.
- An exploration of nature of the God of Classical theism and the continuing existence of evil and subsequent suffering.
- Reference to the arbitrary and unequal nature of evil.
- An exploration of atheism's support for this statement, the irreconcilable nature of a benevolent deity against a context of evil and suffering – Stephen Fry's interview.
- An exploration as to whether evil ever leads to positive benefits, whether the end can justify the means.
- A discussion of the immense scale of evil and subsequent suffering.
- An analysis of specific examples of moral and natural evil, historical and/or contemporary.
- Reference to the views of relevant scholars such as Plantinga, Dawkins and Rowe.
- The responses of contemporary Humanists, Christians, Existentialists and/or Marxists to the dilemma of evil.
- Reference to eschatological teachings within Christianity and atheism's rejection of any form of life after death.
- Counterchallenge to the stated claim – theism's continued support for the God of Classical theism even in the face of evil, the limitation of human understanding of the nature of the Divine and the Divine plan, the message of the Book of Job.
- Reference to the issue of animal suffering.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

**Total**

**100**