ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2019

Religious Studies

Assessment Unit AS 5

assessing

The Celtic Church in Ireland in the 5th, 6th and 7th Centuries

[SRE51]

WEDNESDAY 22 MAY, AFTERNOON

MARK SCHEME

General Marking Instructions

Introduction
The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives
Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
    – religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
    – influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
    – cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
    – approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses
In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking
Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking
Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17 or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks
Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

AS Bands

Total Marks: [25]

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	• An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[21]–[25]
4	• A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[16]–[20]
3	• A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[11]–[15]
2	• A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[6]–[10]
1	• A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[0]–[5]

AS Bands   **Total Marks: [25]**

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	• A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[21]–[25]
4	• A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[16]–[20]
3	• A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[11]–[15]
2	• A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[6]–[10]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	• A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A

Answer **one** question from this section

1 **(a)** Discuss the portrait of Patrick that emerges from his **Confessio**.

Answers may include:
- Patrick's humility and gratitude to God for saving him and for God's support during his mission to Ireland.
- His sense of inadequacy, e.g. lack of education.
- Patrick's Trinitarian spirituality and love of scripture.
- His fear of judgement, regret for boyhood sin and feelings of unworthiness.
- Patrick's love of prayer, his faith and trust in God.
- His pride in his missionary work and accomplishments, e.g. Blessed Maiden and thousands baptised in Christ.
- How Patrick's experience of slavery affected his outlook on life.
- Patrick's sense of loneliness and longing to return home.
- His approach to his mission to the Irish showing ingenuity, courage and wisdom, e.g. converting Kings, inculturation.
- Patrick's hurt at the actions of British clergy towards his mission in Ireland and sense of betrayal by his friend.
- Examples from the Confessio to illustrate points made.
- Possible reference to scholars such as Duffy, Hanson and Bieler.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1) [25]

(b) "Very little is known about the arrival of Christianity into Ireland before Patrick."

With reference to the available evidence, evaluate this statement. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:
- The view of some scholars that the method by which Christianity spread to Ireland before the mission of Patrick will remain unclear and a matter for mere speculation and guess work.
- The presence of Christians in Ireland prior to the mission of Patrick as evidenced by suggestions in both the writings of Patrick (e.g. Confessio) and external writings (e.g. Jerome).
- The paucity of writings in the period before the mission of Patrick and the reliance on other forms of evidence to explore the arrival of Christianity, e.g. archaeological evidence.
- The argument that trade between Ireland, Britain and the Continent afforded the opportunity for the sharing of religious beliefs which led to the gradual infiltration of Christianity to Ireland.
- The view that the slave trade meant that captured slaves who were Christian passed on knowledge of the religion to their captors and others with whom they came in contact.
- Speculation that the movement of scholars, escaping the barbarian invasions of the Roman Empire, to Ireland is seen by some as a possible means by which Christianity arrived in Ireland.
- The presence of colonies of Celtic peoples from Ireland living in Britain and the possibility that they remained in contact with relatives at home spreading the central tenets of the Christian faith.
- The argument that various forms of trade, movement of scholars and the presence of colonies do not in themselves prove anything about the arrival of Christianity into Ireland.
- Prosper's Chronicles and other writings which outline the arrival of Palladius and the nature of his work in Ireland before Patrick.
- The views of some scholars (e.g. Carney) that the mission of Palladius was actually to Scotland and that the references by Prosper reveal nothing about the arrival of Christianity to Ireland before the mission of Patrick.
- The argument that the presence of the words for 'Easter' and 'Priest' but not 'Bishop' in the archaic Irish is significant.
- Reference to the possibility that pre-Patrician saints (e.g. Ailbe) were active in the south of Ireland and the counter-view of some scholars that these saints were not necessarily pre-Patrician.
- Relevant views of scholars such as Carney, Henry and Thomas.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
(AO2)   [25]

AVAILABLE MARKS

50

2 (a) "Muirchú's **Life of Patrick** can only be understood in relation to the political and religious circumstances in which it was written."

With reference to this statement, examine why Muirchú's **Life of Patrick** may have been written.

Answers may include:
- Hagiography as a literary genre focused on the elevation and promotion of a saint by extolling the virtues and importance of the subject in an exaggerated manner.
- The concern of Muirchú to link Patrick with the church of Armagh as one of the central purposes of the hagiographical work, e.g. Daire's donation of land at Armagh on which Patrick built his Church.
- Muirchú's attempt to explain the reasons why Patrick is buried in Downpatrick and not in Armagh.
- Muirchú's wish to disassociate Patrick with the Ulaid and promote Patrick's relationship with the now politically dominant Uí Néill.
- Patrick's conversion of the Uí Néill King, Loeghaire, at Tara.
- Muirchú's use of heroic feats to promote Patrick over other Celtic saints.
- Muirchú's use of miracle and malediction stories to elevate Patrick's status and power, e.g. Coroticus being turned into a fox.
- Muirchú's concern to show the defeat of paganism throughout the island of Ireland by Patrick.
- Possible reference to scholars such as Gougaud, Hughes and Bury.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)   [25]

(b) Comment on the view that hagiography is only of interest to the religious believer. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:
- Muirchú's admission in relation to his little skill and uncertain sources.
- The presence of historically accurate content in parts of hagiographical works, e.g. Cogitosus' description of a seventh century Church.
- The diminished value of hagiographical works due to the omission of negative features in the lives of the saints portrayed in hagiography, e.g. Patrick's sinful youth.
- The nature of Hagiography as a literary genre written in praise and promotion of a particular Saint and valuable for devotional purposes.
- The paucity of sources used by the writers of hagiography.
- The inconsistencies between hagiography and other historical documents that reduces the value of hagiographical works, e.g. the fate of Coroticus in Muirchú's Life compared with Patrick's Letter to Coroticus.
- Reference to valuable incidental information, useful to historians, provided in hagiography that sheds light on the political, social and religious circumstances in the time in which it is written, e.g. political situation in Armagh as illustrated by the dispute over Patrick's body, the cult of the deer at Armagh.
- The value of hagiography in using mythology to convey theological and spiritual points relevant to any age.
- Discussion of the value placed on hagiography in light of modern day judgements, which are based mainly on scientific reason.
- Examples from hagiography to illustrate points made.
- Views of scholars such as Hughes, Morris, Bury and Bieler.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
(AO2)   [25]

50

Section B

Answer **one** question from this section

3 **(a)** Examine the reasons for the change from episcopal to monastic organisation in the Celtic Church.

Answers may include:
- The nature of the episcopal Church founded by Patrick and his love of monastic spirituality.
- The change from episcopal to monastic organisation as both revolutionary but gradual in nature.
- The argument that Ireland did not inherit from the continent a pure episcopal system of church governance but rather a form of church governance that recognised the importance of the monastic lifestyle.
- The view that larger episcopal settlements, e.g. Armagh, already resembled monasteries, meaning the change to monasticism proper would have been straight forward.
- Reference to the fact that Ireland never knew Roman organisation and as such the absence of Roman infrastructure and settlements, such as towns and cities, meant that the episcopal organisation of the Church did not suit Ireland.
- The role of the plague of the 540s in weakening the episcopal structures of the Celtic Church and the relative safety monasteries were able to provide.
- The Celtic ideas of Kin and Kingship and how they influenced the type of Church organisation favoured by Christians in Ireland.
- The economics that underpinned both the episcopal and monastic Church structures as being decisive in determining the success of the monastic system of Church organisation over the episcopal system of organisation (e.g. land donation).
- The early influence of missionaries from Britain and the continent who favoured monasticism, e.g. Gildas.
- The idea that Church regulations did not keep pace with the rapid spread of Christianity in Ireland, resulting in a Church organisation that was unplanned and unique.
- Views of scholars such as Kenney, Hughes, Ryan and de Paor.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
(AO1) [25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the view that religious belief must always adapt itself to political and social developments. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:
- An open-ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples.
- The suggestion that religious belief must conform to the political and social realities of society at a particular time in order to remain relevant.
- The view that religious doctrine and religious belief is unchanging and that religion must, at times, be counter-cultural in the face of challenging political and social ideologies.
- Understanding that faith, politics and society must constantly be in a state of dialogue and religious belief has a role in challenging political and societal assumptions.
- Critical examination of the interaction between religious belief, politics and developments in society around moral issues such as abortion, euthanasia and capital punishment.
- The approach taken by some religious denominations to change religious beliefs in line with developments in society, e.g. same sex marriage.
- The argument that, while some religious beliefs can change, those that are Divine Law and/or Biblical cannot be changed.
- Reference could be made to the prominence of consumerism, materialism and individualism and how these social phenomena are challenged by religious belief and practice.
- How political systems of governance can be incompatible with religious belief, e.g. communism and the Catholic Church in China.
- It has been argued that religion has a central role in informing political discourse in relation to issues that require legislation, e.g. ethical considerations concerning medical advances.
- Some Christians value traditional beliefs, that give certainty in an ever-changing world, and argue that these beliefs should not change regardless of political or societal changes.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.
(AO2) [25]

50

4 **(a)** In what ways was Celtic penitential practice distinctive from the wider church at that time?

Answers may include:
- Penitentials were handbooks for clergy involved in work as confessors. They facilitated the introduction of a new form of penance in the Church.
- The view of sin as a sickness was Celtic in origin and led to the idea of penance as a cure and the confessor as a doctor of the soul who could support and guide the Penitent in their time of need.
- The focus in the Celtic Penitentials on sins of thought moved away from a sole focus on the actions of a person to the intentions of the person.
- Concepts such as compensation, which were present in Brehon law, were incorporated into the Celtic Penitentials where a victim had to be compensated by the sinner for the injury caused.
- The Celtic Penitentials promoted the idea of graded penances whereby the status of the sinner and the nature of the sin was examined as part of the process of coming to a decision on an appropriate penance, e.g. a cleric was given a greater penance for a sin than a lay person.
- Unlike early Continental practice, penance was repeatable.
- Celtic penitential practice promoted private confession, private penance and avoided public identification of penitents.
- The concept of 'Anamchara' or 'soul friend' was central to Celtic penitential practice.
- Increase focus on sexual sin in the Celtic Church penitential practice compared to the wider church.
- Celtic Penitentials proposed a range of different types of penances closely linked to the nature of the sin. This was a development of the idea of contraries curing contraries.
- Commutation, the system whereby shorter more intense periods of penance could be performed instead of a longer penance, was a notable innovation of Celtic penitential practice.
- Examples from the Penitential texts to illustrate points made.
- Views of scholars such as Connolly and McNeill.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
(AO1)   [25]

(b) "Total forgiveness is idealistic but not impossible."

With reference to other aspects of human experience, assess this claim. Justify your answer.

Answers may include:
- An open-ended response citing relevant contemporary and/or historical examples.
- Scriptural references to the importance of total forgiveness in the Christian faith and Jesus' teaching on forgiveness.
- Examples of individuals who offered total forgiveness to those who had perpetrated a great injustice, e.g. Nelson Mandela.
- Exploration of the view that total forgiveness is impossible, given the nature of the human condition, which so often seeks revenge and retribution following injustice.
- Examples of people who are unable to forgive, despite their faith, due to the great hurt they experienced, e.g. Julie Nicholson.
- Corrymeela and other organisations that work to bring about reconciliation that can lead to total forgiveness.
- The argument that total forgiveness is impossible and idealistic as true forgiveness is a process not a one-time event.
- The argument that issues such as justice, apology and recompense are more important than forgiveness and without these forgiveness is idealistic and impossible.
- The view of some that total forgiveness is in the interest of all parties as forgiveness can help victims with healing and recovery.
- The argument that remembrance is an important aspect of honouring the memory of those who have suffered injustice and that total forgiveness does not mean forgetting what has happened.
- The view that total forgiveness may be idealistic but is an important part of most world religions.
- Discussion on the nature of forgiveness and what it means to forgive another person.

Accept valid alternatives
Mark in levels
Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.
(AO2)   [25]   50

Total	**100**