



ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS)
General Certificate of Education
2019

Religious Studies
Assessment Unit AS 7
assessing

**Foundations of Ethics with Special Reference to
Issues in Medical Ethics**

[SRE71]

TUESDAY 28 MAY, MORNING

**MARK
SCHEME**

General Marking Instructions

Introduction

The main purpose of a mark scheme is to ensure that examinations are marked accurately, consistently and fairly. The mark scheme provides examiners with an indication of the nature and range of candidates' responses likely to be worthy of credit. It also sets out the criteria which they should apply in allocating marks to candidates' responses.

Assessment objectives

Below are the assessment objectives for **GCE Religious Studies**

Candidates should be able to:

- demonstrate knowledge and understanding of religion, including:
 - religious, philosophical and/or ethical thought and teaching;
 - influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies;
 - cause and significance of similarities and differences in belief, teaching and practice; and
 - approaches to the study of religion and belief (AO1); and
- analyse and evaluate aspects of, and approaches to, religion and belief, including their significance, influence and study (AO2).

Quality of candidates' responses

In marking the examination papers, examiners should be looking for a quality of response reflecting the level of maturity which may reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old which is the age at which the majority of candidates sit their GCE examinations.

Flexibility in marking

Mark schemes are not intended to be totally prescriptive. No mark scheme can cover all the responses which candidates may produce. In the event of unanticipated answers, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement to assess the validity of answers. If an answer is particularly problematic, then examiners should seek the guidance of the Supervising Examiner.

Positive marking

Examiners are encouraged to be positive in their marking, giving appropriate credit for what candidates know, understand and can do rather than penalising candidates for errors or omissions. Examiners should make use of the whole of the available mark range for any particular question and be prepared to award full marks for a response which is as good as might reasonably be expected of a 17- or 18-year-old GCE candidate.

Awarding zero marks

Marks should only be awarded for valid responses and no marks should be awarded for an answer which is completely incorrect or inappropriate.

Mark schemes for tasks or questions which require candidates to respond in extended written form are marked on the basis of levels of response which take account of the quality of written communication.

Levels of response

In deciding which level of response to award, examiners should look for the 'best fit' bearing in mind that weakness in one area may be compensated for by strength in another. In deciding which mark within a particular level to award to any response, examiners are expected to use their professional judgement. The following guidance is provided to assist examiners.

- **Threshold performance:** Response which just merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the bottom of the range.
- **Intermediate performance:** Response which clearly merits inclusion in the level and should be awarded a mark at or near the middle of the range.
- **High performance:** Response which fully satisfies the level description and should be awarded a mark at or near the top of the range.

Each of the two assessment objectives have been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

Other Aspects of Human Experience at AS Level

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, when required, to access Bands 3–5.

Synoptic Assessment at A2 Level

Candidates must support their answer with reference to at least one other unit of study to access Bands 4–5.

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience in their AO2 response to access Bands 3–5.

Quality of written communication

Quality of written communication is taken into account in assessing candidates' responses to all tasks and questions that require them to respond in extended written form. These tasks and questions are marked on the basis of levels of response. The description for each level of response includes reference to the quality of written communication.

For conciseness, quality of written communication is distinguished within levels of response as follows:

- Level 1: Quality of written communication is basic.
- Level 2: Quality of written communication is limited.
- Level 3: Quality of written communication is good.
- Level 4: Quality of written communication is very good.
- Level 5: Quality of written communication is excellent.

In interpreting these level descriptions, examiners should refer to the more detailed guidance provided below:

Level 1 (Basic): The candidate makes only a basic selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material lacks clarity and coherence. There is little or no use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are basic and the intended meaning is not clear.

Level 2 (Limited): The candidate makes a limited selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. The organisation of material may lack clarity and coherence. There is limited use of specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar may be such that intended meaning is not clear.

Level 3 (Good): The candidate makes a reasonable selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with some clarity and coherence. There is good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently competent to make meaning clear.

Level 4 (Very Good): The candidate makes a very good selection and use of an appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with clarity and coherence. There is very good use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a very good standard to make meaning clear.

Level 5 (Excellent): The candidate successfully selects and uses the most appropriate form and style of writing. Relevant material is organised with a high degree of clarity and coherence. There is widespread and accurate use of appropriate specialist vocabulary. Presentation, spelling, punctuation and grammar are of a sufficiently high standard to make meaning clear.

Band	AO1 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An excellent response to the question asked • Demonstrates comprehensive understanding and knowledge • Demonstrates a comprehensive understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very high degree of relevant evidence and examples • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and vocabulary with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding and almost totally accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a high degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A very good range of relevant evidence and examples • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A good response to the question asked • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding and mainly accurate knowledge • Demonstrates a reasonable degree of understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A good range of relevant evidence and examples • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response to the question asked • Demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates limited understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • A limited range of evidence and/or examples • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response to the question asked • Demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding • Demonstrates minimal understanding of the influence of beliefs, teachings and practices on individuals, communities and societies • Little, if any, use of evidence and/or examples • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive and coherent response demonstrating an excellent attempt at critical analysis • An excellent attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • An excellent attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • An excellent attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A sophisticated answer with a clear and coherent structure • An extensive range of technical language and terminology with accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[21]–[25]
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A very good response demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis • A very good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A very good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A very good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A mature answer with a mainly clear and coherent structure • A very good use of technical language and vocabulary with a mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[16]–[20]
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A reasonable response demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis • A good attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A good attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which are set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience • A good attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A reasonably mature answer with some evidence of structure and coherence • A good use of technical language and vocabulary with a reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[11]–[15]
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A limited response demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis • A limited attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A limited attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which struggle to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A limited attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A limited answer with limited evidence of structure and coherence • A limited use of technical language and vocabulary with a limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[6]–[10]

Band	AO2 Performance Descriptors	Marks
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A basic response demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis • A basic attempt at the application of beliefs, values and teachings to the question asked • A basic attempt using evidence and reasoning to construct well informed and balanced arguments which fail to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience • A basic attempt at providing personal insight and independent thought • A basic answer with basic structure and coherence • A basic use of technical language and vocabulary with a poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar 	[0]–[5]

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience, where necessary, to access Bands 3–5.

Section A**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question from this section

1 (a) Examine the importance of the Primary Precepts in Natural Moral Law.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to the Primary Precepts – to reproduce, to learn and educate children, ordered society, self-preservation and preservation of the innocent, worship God; awareness of why they were generated and are important.
- How these precepts are fundamental to Natural Moral Law as they reveal the ultimate purpose of human life, how they are essentially intuitive.
- How in the religious view these precepts are fundamental principles revealed by God.
- How the precepts are underpinned by the Synderesis Rule – do good and avoid evil.
- How observance of this rule helps to achieve fulfilment and happiness.
- The importance of the use of reason (as human beings are rational creatures) in fulfilling the requirements of the precepts.
- The role of Secondary Precepts (injunctions which flow from the Primary Precepts) – rules that will fulfil the requirements of the Primary Precepts, e.g. Do not kill fulfils the precept of protection of the innocent, Do not commit adultery fulfils the precept of achieving an ordered society.
- How while the Primary Precepts are self-evident, the secondary injunctions are not as they have to be worked out.
- How the Primary Precepts are absolute – they apply to everyone and can never change.
- Possible exemplification of the application of the precepts within medical ethics, e.g. how abortion is morally wrong as it contravenes the precepts of protection of the innocent and to reproduce.
- How the application of the Doctrine of Double Effect can align with the Primary Precepts.
- The deontological character of Natural Moral Law.
- The profile of the theory within religious ethics especially Roman Catholicism.
- Key figures associated with Natural Moral Law, e.g. Aquinas, Finnis.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) To what extent is it true that morality should be about obeying moral commands? Justify your answer.

Answers may include:

- The role of moral rules in ethical decision making – religious and non-religious views.
- The importance of moral commands/absolutes within the Christian tradition, e.g. fidelity to the teaching of the Ten Commandments and to the moral teaching of Jesus.
- The fundamental requirement to love God and love your neighbour.
- The role of moral absolutes in moral decision making, e.g. obedience to a biblical injunction, e.g. do not kill (homicide); obedience to the primary precepts as detailed in Natural Moral Law, e.g. self-preservation (suicide); obedience to the categorical imperative (Kant), e.g. not telling a lie; how moral absolutes create certainty in morality.
- The need for moral rules to counteract moral relativism, to counter dilution of moral standards, to negate the “poison of subjectivism”, to avoid moral chaos.
- Deontological approaches and the importance of duty in moral decision making.
- Divine Command theory.
- Problems with the insistence on obeying moral commands/absolutes, e.g. can be legalistic, inflexible, undermine personal autonomy, overlooking context.
- For Kierkegaard – how ‘faith involves the teleological suspension of the ethical’ (religion trumps ethics) and possible counter-argument.
- The appeal of teleological approaches to moral decision making, e.g. utilitarianism, Situation Ethics.
- How the contemporary age is increasingly secular in character, how traditional approaches to moral decision making underpinned by religion are deemed peripheral in the lives of people.
- How utilitarianism appears to be the ethic of choice in the contemporary era, how it is increasingly influencing developments in medical ethics.
- How the adoption of approaches like utilitarianism need not necessarily lead to antinomianism as there is an absolutist character inherent in the theory, e.g. insistence on achieving “the greatest happiness of the greatest number”.
- The views of various writers, e.g. Peter Singer, Sam Harris, Richard Dawkins, Stephen Fry, Alain de Botton.
- Problems with the advocacy of secular approaches, e.g. rejection of fixed moral norms, herd morality, compromising justice, rejection of Divine Law.
- Defence of religious approaches, e.g. need for moral standards, Biblical ethics as having continued relevance, need for clear and undiluted teaching as in Biblical and/or Church teaching.
- The role and place of conscience in moral decision making.
- The role and place of Proportionalism in moral decision making.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

AVAILABLE
MARKS

50

2 (a) Explain how the Sanctity of Life principle informs the arguments against euthanasia.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- How the Sanctity of Life principle underpins the religious view of the value of human life and so informs views on issues in medical ethics.
- How this principle maintains that human life has inherent value as human life is sacred as it has been created by God, the human person as “imago dei”.
- How because of this principle there is a responsibility, particularly for Christians, to respect and protect all human life.
- How the principle is informed by relevant Biblical and Church teaching, e.g. the Genesis teaching, the Ten Commandments, Paul’s teaching, Natural Moral Law.
- How because of this teaching God is seen as the author of life and that the body is the temple of the Holy Spirit.
- How euthanasia therefore contravenes the Sanctity of Life teaching in that the sovereignty of God is undermined, how the prohibition on killing in the Commandments is ignored, how human life is not intrinsically valuable.
- How the Christian view of death and the value of human suffering is also impugned.
- How euthanasia contravenes the guidance of Natural Moral Law.
- How Christians can see euthanasia as a challenge to God’s divine will.
- The advocacy of hospice care as an alternative to the appeal of euthanasia.
- The slippery slope argument, the dangers of misuse.
- Various denominational views on euthanasia, e.g. Roman Catholic, Presbyterian.
- Conservative as against liberal Christian views.
- The influence of Situation Ethics.
- How for some, life is not to be preserved at all costs but treated with dignity (the weak Sanctity of Life principle).
- How secular ethicists can have issues with euthanasia based on a secularised view of the sanctity of life principle.
- The Passive/Active Distinction in the debate.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) Assess the view that the legalisation of euthanasia would fatally undermine the doctor/patient relationship. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE
MARKS

Answers may include:

- The importance of trust in the relationship between doctor and patient.
- The importance of the Hippocratic Oath.
- How if euthanasia was legalised the relationship between doctor and patient could possibly be fatally undermined. Would it do irreparable damage or not?
- How the perception of the fundamental role of the doctor could change, especially how the doctor is seen as an agent of hope.
- Increased anxiety for the elderly, the disabled and the infirm in medical care.
- The legacy of individuals such as the practitioners Harold Shipman and Jack Kevorkian.
- The danger of misdiagnosis and possible counter argument, e.g. confirmation by two doctors.
- The slippery slope argument and possible counter argument, e.g. a scare tactic.
- Human life as precious, euthanasia as promoting a culture of death.
- Implications for infant euthanasia.
- The right to freedom from unnecessary pain and suffering, the quality of life argument.
- The right to a dignified death, a moral way to die.
- The sovereignty of the individual, respect for the autonomy of the dying person.
- The argument for assisted dying rather than assisted suicide.
- The need to ensure more efficient use of medical resources, the influence of utilitarianism.
- The relevance of the four key principles of autonomy, non-maleficence, beneficence and justice in the debate (as enunciated by Beauchamp and Childress).
- The responsibility placed on the doctor who has deep religious convictions.
- Examples of how the legalisation of euthanasia has fatally undermined the doctor/patient relationship such as “sanctuary certificates” (Holland).
- Recent move by Dutch officials to prosecute a doctor who “had not acted carefully” and “overstepped a line” in euthanising an elderly woman with dementia (November, 2018).

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO2)

[25]

50

Section B**AVAILABLE
MARKS**Answer **one** question from this section

3 (a) "Situation Ethics is a theory that puts the person at the centre of moral decision making."

With reference to this statement, explain the key principles in Situation Ethics.

Answers may include:

- Specific reference to the prefacing statement.
- Awareness of the key principles in Situation Ethics: The Working Principles of Pragmatism, Relativism, Positivism, Personalism; the Fundamental Principles (x6), e.g. love's decisions are made situationally, not prescriptively.
- Clear demonstration of how Situation Ethics is a people-centred theory as exemplified by these principles (need not be exhaustive), e.g. Personalism – how Situation Ethics puts people first just as Jesus did in his ministry; "Love wills the neighbour's good, whether we like him or not." – how real Christian love desires the good of the other person (agape).
- Possible reference to case studies used by Fletcher to illustrate Situation Ethics at work, e.g. that of Mrs Bergmeier or other case studies, e.g. from medical ethics.
- The importance of the primacy of love – agapeistic love as the ruling norm, unconditional selfless love.
- How the ruling norm of moral decision-making is love, nothing else.
- The desire to emulate the example of Jesus.
- Situation Ethics as a simpler and less complicated alternative to legalism in ethics, a person-centred approach.
- The contribution of Joseph Fletcher to the development of the theory.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the validity of Narrative Ethics for moral decision making in medical ethics. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the view in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary exemplification.
- Narrative Ethics as an alternative approach to moral decision making which is interested in the human story.
- How Narrative Ethics contains elements of Situation Ethics and Virtue Ethics, especially the importance of personalism.
- The appeal of Narrative Ethics in contemporary medical ethics as it can place the patient at the heart of the situation, as every situation is unique to that individual.
- How other ethical theories are seen as unsuitable as they advocate fixed principles.
- How Narrative Ethics can develop the empathic skills of the medical personal involved.
- How Narrative Ethics can be seen as devoid of principles and prone to subjectivism.
- The need for specific guidelines in medical ethics to point individuals in the right direction when confronted with tough decisions; narrative not enough; how, if there were no definitive principles, medical professionals could do what they want.
- The value of the long-standing principles held in traditional medical ethics – autonomy, non-maleficence, beneficence, justice.
- Joan McCarthy's views on principlism vs. narrative ethics (2003).
- Possible reference to case studies such as the "forgetful mourner" and that of Dax Cowart.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

4 (a) Examine how the case for assisted conception can be supported by utilitarian theory.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- The blight of infertility, an illness to be treated like all other ailments.
- How science can assist reproduction contributing to the betterment of the human condition.
- How utilitarianism seeks to achieve *the greatest happiness of the greatest number* and if assisted conception can help to achieve this, it can be advocated.
- How in utilitarianism the end can justify the means, the gift of life to an infertile couple.
- How for some people a child is seen as a right.
- How in maximising happiness for all, same sex couples can avail of assisted conception to have a child.
- How assisted conception can enhance the happiness/benefits for all involved in the process, e.g. the commissioning parents, the donors, the medical team, the surrogate, the child – thus, as a collaborative effort many can benefit.
- How assisted conception need not undermine the understanding of sex, marriage and the family.
- How the gift of children can lead to the completion of marriage.
- How utilitarianism can support the process involved even if loss/disappointment is encountered (e.g. failure of an IVF cycle, discarded embryos) as the result is worthwhile.
- Possible reservations utilitarians may have with assisted conception, e.g. the low success rate, the financial costs, other more pressing concerns in the world.
- How in an increasingly secularised world with traditional religious teaching being seen as outdated, the utilitarian justification has an appeal for many.
- How Christian utilitarians could lend their support to assisted conception.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

(AO1)

[25]

(b) "Religion must have a role in the public square on faith and moral matters." With reference to other aspects of human experience, evaluate the truth of this statement. Justify your answer.

AVAILABLE MARKS

Answers may include:

- Consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience.
- Possible historical and/or contemporary exemplification.
- Religion as an integral part of society, of what it means to be human and so can contribute to public dialogue that is in the interests of society.
- The issues being addressed in the public square are relevant to religion, e.g. social welfare systems, poverty, environmental ethics, access to health care, same sex marriage, business ethics, sex education of children.
- How many of these issues relate to principles and beliefs identifiable with religion, e.g. respect for life, concern for the poor, the importance of interdependence.
- How religion can learn from the example set by religious figures in the past who entered the public square and debated issues, e.g. the prophet Amos, Jesus, Martin Luther King, Oscar Romero.
- How the religious believer cannot ignore injustice, even within religion itself.
- How the religious believer is called to fulfil the prophetic role.
- How the religious believer cannot "live apart" from society.
- How some religious believers do choose to separate themselves from the society in which they live, e.g. the Amish.
- How secularists can argue that religion has no valid role to play in forming shared values and has no place in the public square, religion and state should be separate.
- The views of various key figures, e.g. Peter Singer, Richard Dawkins, Stephen Fry.
- How some of the criticisms that have been levelled against religion can apply to secularism, e.g. intransigence, intolerance.
- How secularism does not have a monopoly on the truth.
- The widespread recognition that religion has made to issues of social justice and the fair distribution of resources.
- How law and public policy are not value free.
- Possible reference to the issue of 'public square' in other faiths e.g. Islam.

Accept valid alternatives

Mark in levels

Candidates must engage with other aspects of human experience to access Bands 3–5.

(AO2)

[25]

50

Total

100